Toward a History of Suffering

In America the... effort to satisfy even the least wants of the body and to provide the little conveniences of life is uppermost in every mind." So Alexis de Tocqueville observed in his classic study of Jacksonian society, Democracy in America. Tocqueville saw the obsession with physical comfort as a distinctly middle-class phenomenon, unknown in traditional societies in which sharp divisions between aristocratic luxury and peasant squalor were accepted as part of the natural order of things.

No minor cultural quirk, "the love of well-being has now become the predominant taste of the nation; the great current of human passions runs in that channel and sweeps everything along in its course." From the utopian dietary schemes of Graham and Kellogg to the latest Tae-Bo workout video, Americans have been obsessed with health, and have seen it as the key to happiness — indeed, to spiritual fulfillment.

The revulsion against physical pain and suffering has come to structure American ideas concerning the most vital issues of life and death. Lethal injection is only the latest "advance" in the search for a painless method of execution consistent with the constitutional prohibition against cruel and unusual punishment. Advocates of euthanasia and physician-assisted suicide argue on the humanitarian grounds that the voluntary termination of life serves the greater good of alleviating human suffering.

The prohibition against pain has shaped both sides of the abortion debate. Defenders of abortion rights routinely argue their case through harrowing descriptions of back alley, coat hanger abortions. Anti-abortion activists have responded in kind with explicit descriptions of safe and legal abortions, such as the "silent scream" sonogram video. Like abolitionist accounts of the flogging of slaves, this anti-abortion strategy attempts to establish a sentimental bond with the unborn through a common ability to feel, and an innate desire to avoid, physical suffering.

In the long march of American Catholics toward middle-class assimilation, this cultural understanding of suffering proved to be one of the most persistent stumbling blocks. The immigrants who built the church of the 19th century came from just those traditional societies Tocqueville saw as so accepting of suffering. American Catholics who quickly adopted political democracy proved much less willing to accept the full range of attitudes Tocqueville saw in cultural democracy. Through much of the 20th century, quasi-traditional understandings of the inevitability of suffering continued to shape the world view of American Catholics even after they achieved middle class economic status.

Scholars are just beginning to examine this aspect of the transformation of American Catholic life. On March 9, the Cushwa Center hosted a lecture by Joseph Chinnici, O.F.M., titled "From Sectarian Suffering to Compassionate Solidarity: Joseph Cardinal Berardin and the American Catholic Language of Suffering." Chinnici is professor of church history at the Franciscan School of Theology in Berkeley, California, and a participant in the Cushwa Center's 20th-century project. Professor Chinnici's lecture

see History of Suffering, page 7
Cushwa/Erasmus Lecture

On February 24, Ronald L. Numbers, the Hilldale and William Coleman Professor of the History of Science and Medicine at the University of Wisconsin, Madison, delivered a talk on "Faith, Hope, and Charity: The History of Religion and Health Care in America." The event was co-sponsored with the Erasmus Institute. James Turner, professor of history at the University of Notre Dame and director of the Erasmus Institute, introduced Professor Numbers.

Despite the enormous body of scholarship on the relation between religion and modern science in general, very little has been written on the relation between religion and the particular modern science of medicine. Professor Numbers argued that secular-minded historians who continue to ignore religion do a great disservice to the complexity of the history of medicine.

Two areas in particular, hospitals and nursing, cannot be understood apart from religion. The period from the 1870s to the 1920s saw an unprecedented boom in the building of hospitals, growing from just under 200 to over 6,000. A substantial percentage of these hospitals were rooted in distinct denominational traditions. In the founding of these hospitals, religious pride and identity took precedence over purely medical concerns. Dedicated to the care of the sick more than the cure of disease, denominational hospitals saw sickness as a time when their members particularly required the comfort of religion, and when non-members were most susceptible to conversion. These religious issues stand outside the relatively narrow focus on great technical and scientific breakthroughs that has dominated the historiography. As such, they provide some of the most fertile ground for new research on the broader social history of medicine.

The field of nursing provides another rich area for investigating the religious dimensions of the history of medicine. The denominational hospitals were staffed primarily by Catholic sisters and Protestant deaconesses. Numbers stressed that Catholic sisters in particular achieved a level of power and leadership in the world of hospital administration that was denied women in most other areas of professional life. The sisters who ran the Catholic hospitals were in effect the CEOs of their day. Surprisingly, they have been ignored by historians of women who have produced such important work on the role of women in the development of other professions. [Editor's note: Barbra Wall's recently completed dissertation at the University of Notre Dame, unknown to Professor Numbers at the time of his talk, addresses this gap in the historiography by examining the role of sisters in nursing and hospital development in the West and Midwest from 1865 to 1915.]

Indeed, Numbers argued that the historiographical framework of professionalization has worked to marginalize the place of religion in the history of medicine. Historians acknowledge the fact that Bellevue Hospital chose a sister as the first superintendent of the first modern, scientific nursing school, but regard her status as a woman religious as merely an incidental holdover from a pre-scientific era of medical care. Sisters continued to staff hospitals in great numbers through the middle of the 20th century, and their understanding of nursing as a vocation — intimately tied to the older, more specifically religious conception of that word — cannot be collapsed into the secular codes of professionalism that have come to dominate health care in America.

Beyond the official world of institutional health care, Numbers argued for the world of folk and faith healing as a vital area in which to explore the relation between religion and medicine. Through the mid-19th century, attitudes toward faith healing tended to break down along confessional lines: Catholics turned to shrines, holy water and the rosary for relief from physical ailments, while Protestants looked down on these devotions as little more than popish superstition. The 1870s saw a shift from this confessional divide to a natural/supernatural divide that cut across denominational lines. As the more intellectual elements of the growing Catholic middle class began to distance themselves from the enchanted world view of popular Catholicism, the Protestant world saw a dramatic turn to ministries that modeled themselves on the miraculous healing practices of the early church as recorded in the Bible.

After initial stirrings in Australia, modern faith healing came to America in the early 20th century with the explosion of Pentecostalism, a new Protestant movement that placed miraculous healing at the center of authentic Christian faith.

Belief in faith healing continued to play an important role in the broader growth of American evangelicalism during the first half of the 20th century. The 1950s, often seen as a period of bland religious conformity, actually experienced a tremendous upsurge in healing ministries whose supernaturalism embarrassed the more sedate, rational religiosity of middle-class, suburban Christians.

Professor Numbers insisted that despite a common commitment to belief in miraculous cures, practitioners of faith healing vary greatly with respect to personal style and attitudes toward conventional medicine. He presented a video of a healing service by Kathryn Kuhlman, the most popular healer of the '60s and '70s. Kuhlman's calm, soothing invocations of the spirit contrast sharply with the more emotional style of the leading healer of the '50s, Oral Roberts. These styles, moreover, evolved over time. Roberts, for example, came to supplement his faith healing with the conventional medical practices of the Oral Roberts Medical Center.

The medical profession has, in return, become more sensitive to the extrasomedical aspects of healing. As the boundaries between faith healing and scientific medicine relax, religious groups have begun to shift their focus from high-tech hospitals to the relatively low-tech areas of preventative medicine and hospice care. In response to audience questions, Numbers commented that the historical profession is finally
beginning to grasp the significance of these changes. The history of religious involvement in medical institutions and the history of faith healing are gradually blending into a new field more broadly defined as the history of health and healing.

**Seminar in American Religion**

On April 1, the Seminar in American Religion met to discuss Kathryn T. Long's *The Revival of 1857-58: Interpreting an American Religious Awakening* (Oxford University Press, 1998). Professor Long teaches American religious history at Wheaton College. Frank Lambert, professor of history at Purdue University, and Christopher Shannon, research associate at the Cushwa Center, served as commentators.

Historian Timothy Smith long ago argued that the religious events of 1857-58 incited a revival of social reform that carried American Protestants through the rest of the 19th century. In contrast, these events survive in the contemporary evangelical imagination as the last great national spiritual revival, a kind of third "great awakening." Returning to the revival as both event and interpretation, Long finds a variety of contested meanings that belie any simple reduction. Much like the church leaders of the time, the historian faces the daunting task of discerning threads of unity in an interdenominational event that had to contain competing social and spiritual visions as disparate as those of Baptists and Episcopalians.

Long places this internal struggle in the broader social context of an expanding media society. As church leaders struggled among themselves to determine the proper direction of the revival, secular newspapers arose as a rival interpretive authority. Acknowledging the role of the media in revivals as early as the first Great Awakening, Long nonetheless argues that the Revival of 1857-58 marks a decisive turning point in clerical control over the use of the media as a promotional tool. In the 18th century, evangelical preachers such as George Whitfield were themselves the entrepreneurs; open to the techniques of the marketplace, they nevertheless subordinated commercialism to the goal of evangelism. By the mid-19th century, political disestablishment and an expanding market economy broke this clerical monopoly on religious information — nowhere more than in the epicenter of the revival, New York City. Secular newspaper editors were more concerned with piety than profits, and tended to sensationalize the revival through focus on the lurid past sins of the newly saved or the celebrity of high-profile converts such as the prizefighter Orville Gardner.

Long's provocative account of the media led commentator Frank Lambert to wonder to what extent the revival was simply a media event. Lambert noted that while relatively quiet in practice, the revival became noisy in the newspapers. At times embarrassed by this sensationalism, ministers nonetheless appreciated the press coverage as good publicity that might actually lead to more conversions.

Lambert speculated that the media influence may have stemmed in part from the nature of the revival itself. With relatively sedate prayer meetings rather than preaching as its central practice, the revival had no strong message to impart to the media. In the absence of the kind of dominant, charismatic figure who had guided earlier revivals, the press often became the dominant voice of public interpretation. Still, Long's research shows that the revival cannot be reduced to mere media construction. The letters and diaries of participants speak of profound and sincere experiences of personal transformation that largely eluded the popular press.

Christopher Shannon also commented on Long's analysis of media. Acknowledging the autonomy of the secular media as a distinct historical development, Shannon nonetheless perceived a declension narrative in Long's account of the fall from an earlier ideal balance of piety and commerce. In the 18th century, conservative Episcopalians and Presbyterians would have seen the work of Baptist and Methodist preachers as part of what Long calls, with respect to developments in 19th-century media, the "ongoing disassociation of revivalism from its theological and ecclesiastical roots." Shannon argued that these roots never ran that deep in America and more attention needs to be given to market ideals inherent in denominationalism, whatever the proximity of religious groups to the market proper.

Despite the dangers posed by new developments in the media, religion maintained its vitality as a public phenomenon. In her book, Long argues against historians who see in 19th-century religion only the steady progress of privatization and feminization. The drama of personal conversion took place within a thick web of social relations; the multiple and overlapping contexts of family, church and voluntary association invested individual faith with deep social significance. These networks of support proved also to be arenas of conflict. Precisely because religion had not become an entirely feminine domain, gender became a particular point of contention.

Denominations differed in their views on women's roles in the church. Baptists and Methodists generally allowed women greater freedom than Episcopalians and Presbyterians to testify and exhort in public meetings. The objections of socially conservative Presbyterians rendered women's participation a "controverted point" unable to be discussed, much less practiced, at the interdenominational meetings.

Meanwhile, the religious and secular opinion shapers focused their attention on the noon-time prayer services held by business men in the heart of New York's financial district. Confounding the conventional historical understanding of a sharp antebellum division between feminine religion and masculine economics, Long argues that the revival looked forward to the late 19th century by promoting a manly vision of Christianity and a Christian vision of capitalism.
Persuaded by Long's account of this transformation in the northeast, Professor Lambert questioned its geographic scope. As the press reduced multiple and contradictory revivals to a single, manageable media event, so it projected this event on the nation in order to inflate the news value of the story. Lambert felt that Long at times concedles too much historical accuracy to this media construction, despite her own empirical evidence that calls into question the existence of a southern revival.

Long replied by insisting on the importance of the revival as a single national event, despite its complex and contradictory nature. Participants embraced the revival as a national phenomenon and invested it with the task of national spiritual transformation. The revival spread out from the cities to the small towns, and gave a distinctive shape to the Yankee revivalism of the second half of the 19th century. Long conceded, however, that the revival never truly extended to the South, where sectionalism undermined the drive for Protestant unity.

The regional limitations point to the key issue on which the revival failed to challenge the conventions of its time: slavery. Another “controverted point,” slavery could no: be discussed at inter-denominational meetings, and proved the most divisive issue of the revival. Abolitionist social concerns, so central to the revivals of the 1830s, were silenced in favor of a spiritual consensus based on a few essential doctrinal precepts and a commitment to Reformation piety. According to Long, the revival had no ethical social vision beyond the belief that individual piety would benefit society indirectly by ensuring the proibity of individual citizens.

Shannon agreed with Long's characterization of the revival's relation to the reform tradition, but commented that her attention to issues of gender and race obscures deeper issues of class. In her contrast between conservatism and reform, Long presents an upper middle class New England conception of public religion as the only alternative to social conservatism. Shannon argued that the reform movements of the 1830s were themselves an evasion of public life, an attempt by a religious minority to exert disproportionate influence on society outside of the official public, political mechanisms of mass democracy. Working-class Catholics notoriously resisted reform, and greater attention to class tensions within Protestant denominations, particularly Baptists and Methodists, would shed greater light on the role of the revival in transforming the relations between public religion and popular politics.

Several seminar participants also questioned Long's account of reform. Donald Luidens of Hope College noted that reform should not be equated with progressive social ideas. Know-Nothingism was a reform movement of sorts, and Long could have done more to place the revival in the context of the anti-immigrant movements of the 1850s. Long responded that while revivalists did wish to Americanize Catholic immigrants by converting them to Protestantism, their efforts were relatively free from the more paranoid anti-Catholicism of the period; regardless, this outreach to Catholic immigrants failed for the most part, and the revival remained a Protestant affair.

Long's study raised several questions concerning the periodization of revivals. John Haas of Bethel College suggested that the lack of attention to doctrine may reflect the vitality of a set of classical Reformation theological assumptions concerning grace and the necessity of conversion still so deeply ingrained as to not require repeated clarification. Thomas Kidd of Notre Dame commented that the revival seemed to mark the end of an era: Subsequent national revivals led by preachers such as Dwight Moody and Billy Graham failed to impress themselves on the popular imagination as a national visitation of God. Christopher Shannon suggested that the increased coverage of revivals, particularly by the proliferating Christian media outlets, has deprived any single revival of the ability to represent the nation.

The questions raised by Long's book reflect the ambitious scope of her undertaking. Severing the link between revival and reform, she suggests new ways of viewing the social consequences of revivalism. By viewing the revival through the various lenses of social reform, mass media and gender, Long provides a model for integrating religious history and cultural history.

**American Catholic Studies Seminar**

On April 6, 2000, the American Catholic Studies Seminar featured a discussion of Sharon M. Leon’s paper, “Before Casti connubii: Early Catholic Responses to the Eugenics Movement in the U.S.” Ms. Leon is a graduate student in the Program in American Studies at the University of Minnesota. Jeanne Petitt of the history department at Hope College served as commentator.

The papal encyclical Casti connubii is generally known for its condemnation of artificial birth control. The document also contains a four-paragraph critique of eugenics and a condemnation of the practice of sterilization. Ms. Leon introduced her paper as part of a larger project that seeks to trace the development of the church teaching that culminated in Casti connubii and explain how Catholics came to be the main group to oppose eugenics.

Sir Francis Galton, a cousin of Charles Darwin, first coined the term "eugenics" in 1883. Convinced that genius was hereditary, Galton sought to develop a scientific sub-discipline to promote the propagation of superior human beings. The rediscovery of the work of the Austrian monk Gregor Mendel at the turn of the century inspired the growing ranks of "eugenicists" with a confidence in the ability of science to determine the laws of heredity. A social as well as a scientific movement, eugenics was inextricably bound up with a broader discourse concerning the racial and ethnic makeup of America.

Inspired by fears of population decline among the ruling Anglo elites, "positive" eugenics sought to encourage higher birth rates among members of the Nordic racial stock, while "negative" eugenics emphasized the need to restrict the immigration of members of the lower racial stocks arriving from southern and eastern Europe. In addition to these measures, promoters of
eugenics advocated the sexual segregation and sterilization of the "unfit," beginning with the institutionalized populations of criminals and the mentally ill. Leon noted that since Catholics tended to fall toward the bottom of the racial hierarchies constructed by promoters of eugenics, they had the most to fear from the new science.

Catholic theologians in America entered the debate on eugenics initially in response to a wave of sterilization statutes that found their way before state legislatures in the first two decades of the 20th century. Despite general suspicion of eugenics, theologians were unable to present a decisive ruling on whether or not sterilization violated natural law.

Some felt it to be a grave mutilation justifiable only if somehow necessary for the preservation of human life, while others argued for the compelling interest of the state and society in the case of sterilizing criminals. Some cautioned that science was not yet developed enough to determine feeblemindedness with sufficient accuracy, while others criticized the social utility arguments for eugenics as an evasion of moral responsibility for the broader social causes of poverty. Virtually all Catholic commentators noted the xenophobic and anti-Catholic underpinnings of eugenist thought.

As on so many other social issues, Father John A. Ryan provided the most powerful public voice for the Catholic position on eugenics. Leon noted that Ryan acknowledged the legitimacy of concerns regarding reproduction by the feeble-minded, yet argued against state regulation in favor of more informal counseling on an individual basis. Ryan reaffirmed the Catholic understanding of marriage and procreation as fundamental human rights and argued against investing states with the power to declare whole segments of the population unfit to reproduce. Along with other Catholic thinkers, he sought to develop an alternative, positive eugenics dedicated to improving the human race through Catholic social teaching. Writing in the Catholic World, Thomas J. Gerrard offered "right reason duly informed by Divine Will" as the best path to social progress.

Leon argued that World War I marked a decisive intensification of the drive for eugenic control of the population. Psychological testing of soldiers during the war revealed appallingly low levels of intelligence in the general population, particularly among non-Nordic groups; the isolationist reaction against the war fanned the flames of xenophobia, leading to new restrictions on immigration. The 1920s saw a renewed push for sterilization laws at the state level. The National Catholic Welfare Conference, itself an outgrowth of wartime mobilization, provided assistance to local groups lobbying against sterilization. Despite these efforts, the Supreme Court affirmed the constitutionality of a Virginia involuntary sterilization law in its Buck v. Bell decision of May 2, 1927.

The Catholic press attacked the ruling, insisting on the sanctity of the individual against the claims of the state. In his pamphlet Human Sterilization, John Ryan warned that the decision threatened to expose minority groups to eugenic extinction, and questioned whether American Catholics had been naive in assuming the compatibility of the U.S. Constitution and Catholic moral teaching.

Still, wishing to appeal to as broad a range of Americans as possible, Ryan made efforts to enlist non-Catholics in his fight against eugenics. Most notably, the NCWC published a pamphlet, Social Care of the Mentally Deficient, by Dr. Charles Bernstein, a Jewish psychiatrist who served as superintendent of a colony for the feeble-minded. Bernstein pleaded for a program of education and vocational training to allow the mentally deficient to make the most of their abilities. Coalitions with non-Catholics continued to be important in the secular political battle, but Casti connubii provided Ryan with the authority to claim a united Catholic front against eugenics.

Jeanne Petit expressed surprise at the diversity of Catholic opinion on eugenics in the early years of the century. How could Catholics reconcile the sterilization of criminals with traditional Catholic social teaching? Leon responded by stressing the importance of distinguishing means and ends for Catholic thinkers of this period. Despite vehement opposition to sterilization, John Ryan actually served on the board of several eugenics organizations. He supported the general goals of a stronger, healthier society, and differed from his adversaries mainly in his stress on education rather than intrusive medical procedures.

These similarities led Professor Petit to question Ryan's relation to mainstream racial thought. Ryan often extolled immigrants as the saving remnant of civilization. In doing so, was he in effect saying that immigrants were white?

Leon argued against linking Catholics to whiteness during this period, and cautioned on the need to be sensitive to the multiple meanings of words such as "nature" and "civilization." Evolutionary biologists, for example, also appealed to "natural law," but clearly differed substantially from Catholic theologians in their understanding of nature. In promoting the ideal of social progress, moreover, Catholics explicitly rejected narrowly Anglo-Saxon understandings of civilization.

Several members of the audience questioned the significance of the eugenics debate in light of subsequent debates on issues such as birth control and abortion. Leon responded that the history of Catholic attitudes toward eugenics is an important missing piece in the history of the church's stand on birth control. Catholic social thought has traditionally seen eugenics, birth control and abortion as of a piece, despite secular efforts to separate them. In the early 20th century, Catholics saw eugenics in relation to a broad range of social issues. The need for a proper historical understanding of these relations is particularly pressing at a time when genetic engineering threatens to revive eugenic doctrines thought to have been discredited by the Holocaust.
Research Travel Grant Report

In 1829, Baptist missionary, Isaac McCoy, traveled from his federal Carey Mission among the Native Americans of the St. Joseph Valley to Washington, D.C. He would successfully lobby in support of the Indian Removal Act (1830), which ordered the relocation of eastern Indians west of the Mississippi. Meanwhile, Leopold Pokagon, a Potawatomi leader, left his village located just south of the mission. He visited the Catholic Archdiocese of Detroit and appealed for a "Black Robe" to live and minister among his people. Pokagon's efforts also succeeded. The arrival of Father Stephen T. Bardin gave the Pokagon the social and political leverage to withstand the removal onslaught and also allowed the Church to renew its ministry throughout a region it had abandoned in the late 1700s.

United by a common Catholicism, Badin and Pokagon nonetheless represent two divergent histories: one leading to the prestigious University of Notre Dame, erected on land the Potawatomi granted to their Black Robe, the other to an abandoned, all-but-forgotten Indian village left only to a few of the university’s and the tribe’s researchers.

Funding from the Cushwa Center enabled me to continue my investigation of relevant paper materials in the Notre Dame archives and the archeological site of Pokagon Village, located north of the university campus in southern Michigan. My research on the history of the Pokagon Band of Potawatomi began shortly after my arrival at the University of Notre Dame in 1998. In scattered ruminations about a dissertation topic with my advisor, Greg Dowd, I was presented with the opportunity of working with archaeologist Mark Schurr, who was just beginning what has become a larger project on Pokagon Village. This association helped me formulate a topic for my dissertation, "In the Shadow of the Eagle’s Wings: The Effects of Removal on Unremoved Indians." It will consider the effects the complimentary federal policies of "civilization" and removal had on Native Americans.

Many scholars have portrayed the Removal Era, which culminated in the 1820s and 1830s, as the nadir of Indian societies east of the Mississippi. These interpretations have validity for some native peoples, but they tend to overlook the experiences of many bands that remained and still reside in the east to this day.

The dissertation research I am conducting will attempt to reassess the removal phenomenon by viewing this turbulent period as a point of genesis for the identities of many Native American bands. The Pokagon Potawatomi will be central to this analysis. The Pokagons were among the most successful in resisting the federal government’s efforts to drive them west. Their hybrid cultural patterns, which blended white-style agricultural subsistence with Potawatomi values, and their new identity, which combined a “Woodland” residential distinction with an ardent Catholic faith, proved a potent strategy for their survival.

The research for this study will benefit from, as well as contribute to, an interdisciplinary and intercultural project that has developed between members of the anthropology and history departments at the University of Notre Dame and the Pokagon Band of Potawatomi. Mark Schurr and John Warren, director of cultural affairs for the Pokagon Band, have been steadily creating a map of the village based on an 1830 survey and conducting modest archaeological digs over the past two years. Over the summers of 1999 and 2000, two undergraduate field schools were conducted in search of archaeological “middens,” a discrete archaeological term for garbage. Midden, along with the floral and faunal assemblages unearthed in these digs, have proved valuable in recreating the lifestyles of the villagers.

The first dig focused on the site of a Potawatomi residence, most likely a wigwam at the eastern extreme of the village. The surface and geophysical surveys found a dense patch of midden probably associated with the residence that had been located on an adjacent knoll. Abundant artifacts were unearthed — from pig and elk teeth to European pottery and crockery — dating to the Pokagon era. They showed that the site has a rich potential for archaeological data.

The second dig tested two locations, the site of the Catholic chapel and the cabin of Leopold Pokagon. The location of the chapel was still clearly visible atop a high ridge on the north side of the village. Unfortunately, the initial dig uncovered little except part of a clay pipe used for pleasure smoking. The work at Leopold Pokagon’s cabin has unearthed the most archaeological data thus far. The survey map identified the precise site of the structure, and shovel probing (the placement of small, systematically gridded test holes) and a metal detector were used to locate artifacts. The metal detector found several scatters of hand-wrought iron nails that were probably used in the construction of the cabin and associated outbuildings. A large area of midden was also located in a low area near the cabin. This midden appears to have been previously disturbed by looters, but it still contains abundant archaeological evidence about daily life at the village.

Even casual inspection of the artifact assemblage suggests that there are significant differences between the artifacts from the 1999 and 2000 excavations. Many of these differences will be explored and interpreted as laboratory analysis and archival research continues. The intermingling of policy, culture and faith during Indian removal is a well-developed dynamic in history, though the region of the Old Northwest and the role Catholicism played throughout the era have been comparatively unexplored. Most studies have
focused on southeastern tribes. Events in the northwest, and Pokagon Village in particular, were just as critical, however, and in some ways even more so. It is not an overstatement to say that the U.S. removal policy was formulated on and around Pokagon’s reserve. The daily life of this region’s Indians shaped Isaac McCoy’s perceptions of the state of Indian affairs, and the Baptist’s published and private thoughts on the subject found an audience among the highest U.S. officials.

The Catholic heritage of McCoy’s neighbors gradually emerged as a significant subplot within this larger drama. The relationship that Indians and federal missionaries shared had many of the same characteristics of other intimate associations. Close proximity exposed the faults of each, and both sides struggled to determine whether those flaws could be overlooked for the sake of something more meaningful. In the case of the Pokagon Potawatomi, Isaac McCoy had exhibited a disproportionate level of self-interest while building a missionary enterprise with assets valued at over $15,000.

The Baptists treated their Potawatomi neighbors like wards and their religious teachings became a point of contention with Catholics throughout the region. McCoy and his assistants were slow to grasp the Potawatomi language and customs. The French Catholic guides McCoy employed often refused to translate matters of a religious nature. Regional Métis, mostly products of French and Indian intermarriage, similarly resisted challenges to their Catholic faith. In this supportive atmosphere, the Pokagon Potawatomi asserted a strong Catholic identity that challenged the government’s removal efforts as well as one of the policy’s leading advocates residing in their midst.

From initial research, it seems as if the Catholic Pokagon were laying a diplomatic and spiritual siege around McCoy’s federal mission when the Archdiocese of Detroit responded to their request for reinforcements in 1829. The strategy worked in the short term as Pokagon’s followers secured an exemption from removal on account of their “religious creed” in supplemental articles to the Treaty of Chicago (1833).

Their Catholicism aided them in the long term as well. Source material in the Notre Dame archives, particularly the Stephen T. Badin Papers, reveals that resident priests, including Badin and Louis DeSalle, helped the band by personally laboring in the fields as well as securing equipment and funds owed to the Potawatomi from earlier treaties. The mission was so successful that Badin turned spiritual affairs over to his assistant, Father DeSalle, and Leopold Pokagon, whom he named a “coadjutor.”

Badin redirected his energies toward the broader task of establishing churches and orphanages throughout the historically Catholic region of northern Indiana and southern Michigan. The phenomenon of Indian removal indirectly inhibited much of his work, but shadows of Badin’s vision remain amid the din of change, growth and migration. Arguably, the most enduring Catholic legacies in this area are the Pokagon Band of Potawatomi and the University of Notre Dame.

The Pokagon’s distinct Catholic identity helped preserve them in their eastern homelands. Unfortunately, the Pokagon’s identity has not been preserved as distinctly at the Catholic university erected on their lands in 1832. With Father Theodore Hesburgh receiving a national honor last summer for his legacy of promoting racial harmony it seems ironic that the school he served fails to appreciate fully the fact that its earliest pillars, Leopold Pokagon and Father Stephen T. Badin, labored in a similar faith and philosophy many years before. Hopefully this project will help rekindle some awareness.

— Ben Secunda
University of Notre Dame

For information on the archaeological dig at Pokagon Village as well as some photographs of the location and artifacts, Mark Schurr has created the following Web site: www.nd.edu/~mschurr/

Toward a History of Suffering

continued from page 1

went far in mapping the terrain for a history of suffering in 20th-century America.

Chinnici took Cardinal Bernardin’s book, The Gift of Peace, as an occasion for reflecting on the changing meaning of suffering for Catholics over the course of the 20th century. Written shortly before Bernardin’s death from cancer in November 1996, The Gift of Peace reflects a profound transformation in the Catholic approach to suffering. Chinnici contrasted the moralistic and cognitive orientation of an earlier Catholic language with Bernardin’s personalistic, affective language. In Bernardin’s work, words like “reason,” “planning” and “mastery” give way to “solidarity,” “compassion” and “community.” Strikingly, Bernardin refuses to link suffering to sin; rather, he approaches it as a process of conversion, a journey toward a new life.

Chinnici traced this transformation over the course of three distinct historical periods. He identified the first period in terms of the language of “suffering in community.” Historically rooted in the codification of Catholic belief and ritual following the Council of Trent, this language reached its apex in American Catholicism during the period from the 1920s to the 1940s. The concern for church unity in the wake of the Reformation invested post-Tridentine theology with a legalistic emphasis on formal rights and duties binding members of the community to each other and the community as a whole to God.

Theologians emphasized the role of God as a just judge and ruler who demanded suffering as the debt owed by man in reparation for sin. In the early 20th century, popular pamphlets such as the Paulist Walter Elliott’s The Mystery of Suffering disseminated this teaching to a wide reading audience. Through the efforts of Elliott and others, American Catholics came to see suffering as an opportunity to share in the crucifixion of Jesus and thus participate in the work of salvation.

Emphasis on the redemptive power of suffering fostered the cult of the “victim soul.” Suffering came to be understood as a sign of sanctity, a sign of a life lived in imitation of Christ. This understanding of the victim soul
permeated a broad range of Catholic devotional practices. Particular devotions such as First Fridays, Holy Hours and the Stations of the Cross came to be seen as acts of self-abnegation necessary to fulfill the requirements of divine justice. Like Jesus, the victim soul suffered not for his own sins, but for the sins of others. Within the sacramental economy of the Church, individual sanctity conferred merit to the whole community.

In language, symbol and theology, this understanding of suffering set American Catholics apart from the Protestants they encountered in the cities of the Northeast and Midwest. These Protestants were heirs to the middle-class reform ethos Tocqueville saw spreading across Jacksonian America. Concern for physical comfort was only one aspect of a larger vision of social progress defined as the expansion of moral freedom and the improvement of material well-being. Increasingly liberal in its theological orientation, the Protestant reform tradition gradually discarded the image of Jesus as suffering servant in favor of Jesus as moral teacher. After this shift from piety to moralism, the social reformer stood as the modern embodiment of the biblical Good Samaritan.

Arthur C. McGill has provided one of the most profound critiques of this moralism from the perspective of the problem of suffering. In his classic work, *Suffering: A Test of Theological Method*, McGill uses the parable of the Good Samaritan as an occasion to return the problem of suffering to the context of Christ’s redemptive sacrifice.

Against the conventions of bourgeois philanthropy and charity, McGill insists that “the problem of neighborly love which faces us in this parable is not to be solved by decent living and ordinary friendliness.” The law of life in the New Testament is not to do good deeds, but to love God as revealed in the Jesus of the cross. As a type of Jesus, the Samaritan “does not balance his service to the wounded man with a reasonable concern for himself.” Placing no limit on his financial responsibility for the injured Jew, he figuratively engages in an act of self-giving love leading to death.

Against the modern tradition of social service, McGill warns that “we face a temptation when we identify love with the power of God, and speak of service as fulfillment.” True Christian service “should be thought of not simply as the improvement of human existence, but as its transfiguration and exaltation.” Service must be a dispossession, an extinction of personal identity, a repudiation of dominative power. Guided by the model of the self-expending love of Jesus on the cross, the Christian does not glory in suffering for its own sake, but as a sign of the essential neediness of man. For McGill, we do not help others to help themselves, but rather help others so that they may in turn help others. Christian service finds its fulfillment in the communal recognition of shared need, not the individual achievement of self-reliance.

As the experience of self-reliance helped to undermine the theological value of suffering for many middle-class American Protestants, so the experience of human neediness helped to sustain the Catholic ethic of suffering in community. Professor Chinnici argued that during the first half of the 20th century Catholics interpreted the persecution of the Church in Mexico, the Depression and World War II as confirmation of the essential role of suffering in God’s plan of salvation. Communal suffering required communal prayer. New devotions to St. Jude (1929), Our Lady of Perpetual Help (1930) and Our Sorrowful Mother (1937) emphasized the power of sighly intercession for relief from pain and sorrow. These national devotional networks directed the experience of suffering toward the communion of saints, and reflected a traditional understanding of suffering as an expression of union with Christ in the mystical body.

Postwar prosperity severed this natural connection between language and experience. The Americanization strategy of the first half of the century came to fruition with the Catholic assimilation into middle-class suburban affluence. American Catholics were to accept the basic social values required of citizens in a modern, capitalist society, yet retain distinctive devotional practices to set them apart from Protestant Americans.

Chinnici referred to this period as one characterized by a language of “sectarian suffering.” Whereas in the earlier period, suffering had been an expression of union with the Mystical Body of Christ, an experience directed outward toward others, it now became a badge of identity that turned Catholics in on themselves. Affluent, suburban Catholics “no longer suffered in solidarity with others in Depression and War, but instead suffered in support of their own separate identity.”

Robert Orsi has provided one of the most scathing accounts of this mid-century Catholic culture of suffering. In his essay, “Mildred, is it fun to be a cripple?” Orsi tells the story of his Uncle Sal, a man afflicted with cerebral palsy. He recalls childhood memories of how on the first Saturday of every month family members would escort Sal to one of the special Masses for “shut-ins” and “cripples” organized by the Blue Army of Mary, a devotional society concerned with spreading the anti-communist message of Our Lady of Fatima.

Uncle Sal occupied a somewhat contradictory position in the Catholic culture of suffering. As a man afflicted with a terrible disease, he stood in special need of the prayers of the community; this same affliction also placed him in a privileged position as intercessor for the community.

For mid-century Catholics, pain retained much of its sacramental significance as participation in the redemptive suffering of Christ on the cross. People such as Sal appeared closer to God by virtue of their affliction. Prayers of the suffering were thought to be more efficacious than those of people who did not experience suffering. In what Orsi
calls "a redistributive economy of distress," pain "could be taken away and applied to the welfare of the healthy." This understanding of prayer was to connect the sick to the world, and stood as a powerful Catholic alternative to the broader American denial of suffering. Unlike Protestants, Catholics did not need to explain or account for pain; instead, comprehensible suffering was the real suffering of all.

The distinctly Catholic understanding of suffering nonetheless accompanied itself to an all-American ethos of positive thinking. The sick and suffering were to be happy in their affliction. According to Orsi, the Catholic culture of suffering had little tolerance for those who refused to accept their pain cheerfully. Catholics had no sympathy for the unsaintly sick. Priests who praised the sick as intercessors were just as likely to scold them as complainers. No matter how terrible their affliction, the sick were constantly reminded that Jesus and Mary suffered more and never complained. Expressions of discontent or resentment on the part of the suffering could quickly call up Old Testament associations of suffering with punishment for sin. As a sign of sin, the sick became objects of scorn. At a less theological level, they were often subjected to teasing and other indignities tolerated within the general cultural acceptance of pain.

According to Orsi, "the devotional ethos of suffering and pain failed actual sick people." As saint or sinner, the individual sufferer never achieved the status of true personhood within the community. The cult of suffering denied the afflicted "the full range of human desires and hopes, including those for love, mastery, and independence." Denied personhood, the suffering were consigned to the spiritual equivalent of the back seat of Catholic culture.

Against this culture, Orsi concludes his essay with a picture of his uncle Sal as "desire and will incarnated," resisting the expectations of his church and family by heroically writing his autobiography in defiance of his approved role of suffering saint. Self-possessed and psychologically independent, Sal, in Orsi's words, "is not offering up his suffering for anyone."

Orsi's essay follows the narrative trajectory of the lives of many mid-century Catholics in retreat from the culture of sectarian suffering. Resentful of suffering as a badge of identity and unwilling to return to suffering in community, many Catholics coming of age in the 1960s embraced the drama of self-creation free from the constraints of their childhood subculture. If the language of suffering disappeared, suffering itself did not. The adolescent rush of liberation faltered in the face of the Vietnam War, ghetto riots, and the collapse of the counterculture. Beyond a small circle of lapsed Catholic intellectuals, autobiography proved a dubious basis for community.

The decline of older languages made the persistence of actual suffering all the more mysterious. Arthur McGill wrote Suffering in response to what he saw as the modern world's inability to see any positive meaning in suffering. In that work, he observes how popular accounts of suffering tend to emphasize its inexplicability. Cancer, nuclear war, technology and the economy appear as obscure destructive powers, with remedies equally obscure and occult. For McGill, the modern world has rejected the Victorian belief in an orderly, rational universe only to return to something like a belief in demons — without, unfortunately, the compensatory belief in God.

More at home with mystery than some of their secular contemporaries, Catholics of the 1970s nevertheless sought new ways to understand the place of suffering in the world around them. Professor Chinnici argued that the communal suffering of Central American and Asian immigrants, the sacrificial symbolism of Latino Catholicism and the general egalitarian reorientation of Catholic theology following Vatican II combined to produce a new understanding of suffering as "compassionate solidarity."

This new language of suffering found articulation in Bernardin's The Gift of Peace. Bernardin writes not as a victim soul, but as a member of a "community of those who suffer." This experience of solidarity grew out of his exchanges with his fellow cancer patients and the prayers and expressions of support he received during his illness. Affirming the communal spirit of Vatican II, Bernardin sees this solidarity extending out from Catholics to include Protestants and non-believers as well. Even modern medical technology acquires sacramental significance within Bernardin's expansive vision: In the "competent, compassionate care" of health care professionals, Bernardin experiences Jesus as healer.

Bernardin begins the discussion of his cancer with a meditation titled "Suffering in Communion with the Lord." Consistent with older understandings, he insists that just as Jesus suffered on the cross, we must expect pain in our lives. Still, he emphasizes that as disciples of Christ, "we suffer in communion with the Lord. And that makes all the difference in the world!" The intractability of suffering frustrates our desire for control. We like to be "fixers" and problem-solvers, yet so much physical suffering still eludes modern medical intervention. "Whenever we are with people who suffer, it frequently becomes evident that there is very little we can do to help them other than be present to them, walk with them as the Lord walks with us." Suffering draws us in on ourselves, but Jesus points us out of ourselves to other people and their needs. The acceptance of suffering is thus a call to action.

This ideal of compassionate solidarity resonates powerfully with developments in our understanding of a dynamic force at work in the contemporary American church, Latino popular Catholicism. In Caminemos con Jesús, Roberto Goizueta has articulated a communal "theology of accompaniment" rooted in the popular Latino rituals.

The Christmas street drama Posadas provides the occasion for the
community to walk with Mary and Joseph in their search for lodging in Bethlehem. In the Via Crucis of the Easter Triduum, the community walks with Jesus as he carries the cross to Calvary. By accompanying Mary and Jesus as outcasts and criminals, the community expresses the “preferential option for the poor” rooted in the gospel Beatitudes and developed most powerfully in Latin American liberation theology.

These public rituals invest suffering with a broad social significance that reflects the Latino experience of marginalization in the United States. As the community accompanies Jesus and Mary through the streets of contemporary American cities, it affirms its dignity in the face of economic and racial discrimination. Walking with Jesus rather than merely following him, communal accompaniment expresses a radical egalitarianism at odds with both the traditional hierarchical structure of the institutional church and the class stratification of American society.

The Gift of Peace reflects a similar egalitarian reorientation in the Catholic understanding of suffering. Professor Chinnici observed that Bernardin’s reflections subvert traditional ecclesiastical hierarchies. Chinnici traced this reorientation beyond its general sources in Vatican II to its more immediate and controversial source in the series of clerical sex scandals that plagued the Church through the 1980s and 1990s. Bernardin himself endured the shame of accusation, and emerged from the experience with a greater understanding of the suffering of victims of sexual abuse.

For Bernardin, the challenge posed to clerical authority by the sex scandals demands a humble recognition of the bond of weakness that unites the Church as an institution with individual believers. In The Gift of Peace, Bernardin eschews the role of teacher and adopts the role of a learner. As an act of penance for clerical sins, Bernardin surrenders himself to the unity of shared grace that joins the ministerial priesthood and the priesthood of all believers.

Professor Chinnici concluded his talk by calling attention to points of continuity across the historical divides of the three approaches to suffering. First, all three languages share a Catholic insistence on the goodness of creation and the necessary participation of men and women in this goodness. Second, all three share a sense of the special call some individuals have to bear witness to the redemptive power of suffering. Third, all affirm an ethic of communal responsibility. Fourth, all stress the importance of personal prayer and assume the participation of individuals in common rituals and liturgical practices. Fifth, and most important, these languages share the central figure of Jesus Christ. Chinnici insisted that the most authentically Catholic language of suffering lies in the “common speech and action of Jesus Christ and the efforts of his Body, the Church, to make him visible and credible.”

The languages of suffering in community, sectarian suffering, and compassionate solidarity each persist in varying degrees among different communities of Catholics today. They often stand as markers of the liberal/conservative divide. Cardinal Bernardin devoted the last months of his life to healing through his inauguration of the Catholic Common Ground Project. The theological continuities across these historical periods provide some of the most promising common ground for healing the ideological divisions within the church today.

The Gift of Peace suggests that any authentically Catholic common ground will, however, remain a sign of contradiction to the main currents of American society. From the opening meditation on “Letting Go” to the concluding Prayer of St. Francis, Bernardin affirms a vision of freedom and solidarity that begins with a radical surrender of self to God. This conception of freedom offends the secular American equation of freedom with autonomy and self-assertion. Any history of suffering that proceeds from this Catholic conception of freedom is bound to rest somewhat uncomfortably alongside the progressive narratives of individual liberation that structure much of mainstream American history writing.

— Christopher Shannon
University of Notre Dame

ANNOUNCEMENTS

• The Episcopal Women’s History Project annually awards Travel/Research grants to support the study of women in the U.S. Episcopal Church and/or women whose Episcopal identification influenced their lives and accomplishments. For information on 2001 grants, contact: Dr. Jane Harris; 4220 Raleigh Dr.; Conway, AR. 72023. The deadline is December 1.

• The Humanities Research Group at the University of Windsor invites applications for Visiting Humanities Fellowships tenable at the University of Windsor in the 2001-02 academic year. Scholars with research projects in traditional humanities disciplines or in theoretical, historical or
philosophical aspects of the sciences, social sciences, arts and professional studies are encouraged to apply. The fellowship will appeal to sabbaticants and those holding research grants, including postdoctoral awards. Applicants must hold a doctorate or the equivalent in experience, research and publications. International applications are encouraged. Visa documents, if required, are the responsibility of the applicant. The fellowship is tenable for a period of four months to one year. No stipend is attached to the fellowship. The Humanities Research Group will provide office space, university affiliation and library privileges. Fellows are expected to work in residence at the HRG for the duration of the award and to deliver a public presentation on their research. There is no application form. Letters of application should include a rationale for working with the HRG, a curriculum vitae, one-page abstract and a detailed description of the research project. Applicants should arrange to have three letters of reference sent directly to the HRG before the deadline. Incomplete applications will not be considered. Direct applications to: Dr. Jacqueline Murray, Director; Humanities Research Group; University of Windsor; 430 Sunset Avenue; Windsor, Ontario N9B 3P4. E-mail: <hrgrmail@uwindsor.ca>. The deadline is February 15, 2001.

- Lilly Endowment, Inc. has awarded a grant to Louisville Presbyterian Theological Seminary of $85 million to support the work of The Louisville Institute through 2003. Founded in 1990 with the aid of a previous grant from the endowment, the institute seeks to enrich the religious life of American Christians and to encourage the revitalization of their institutions by bringing together those who lead religious institutions with those who study them so that the work of each might inform and strengthen the work of the other. To receive further information about the Louisville Institute's grant programs or conferences, please contact: The Louisville Institute; 1044 Alta Vista Road; Louisville, KY 40205. E-mail: <info@louisville-institute.org>. Web site: www.louisville-institute.org.

- The Organization of American Historians invites nominations for the 2001 ABC-CLIO America: History and Life Award. The award is given to recognize and encourage scholarship in American history advancing new perspectives on accepted interpretations or previously unconsidered topics. Not limited to any particular subject area or chronological period, the award seeks to recognize journal articles that propose new perspectives and explore new avenues of investigation. The award carries with it a cash prize of $750. Individuals as well as editors are encouraged to submit nominations. Each entry must be published during the period November 16, 1998, through November 15, 2000. One copy of each entry must be received by each member of the award committee by November 15, 2000. No late submissions will be accepted. For committee member mailing addresses, please contact: Organization of American Historians; Office of the Executive Director; 112 North Bryan Avenue; Bloomington, IN 47404-4199. E-mail: <oah@oah.org>.

**Archives**

- The Women and Leadership Archives announces the opening of the papers of Sister Ann Ida Gannon, B.V.M., for study by scholars. The papers reflect Sister Gannon’s term (1957-74) as president of Mundelein College, as well as her path-breaking work at the local, state and national levels in education and government. Sister Gannon’s papers offer insight into the history of the numerous organizations on whose governing board she served, including the Association of American Colleges Project on Women, the President’s Task Force on Women’s Rights and Responsibilities and the Bishop’s Commission on Ecumenism. Supplementing these records is an array of pamphlets, reports and clippings relating to the history of women, with special emphasis on women and religion and women in higher education. For further information, contact Valerie Gerrard Browne, Director; Women and Leadership Archives; Loyola University of Chicago; Gannon Center for Women and Leadership; Sullivan Center 200; 6525 North Sheridan Road; Chicago, IL 60626. Web site: www.lac.edu/gannon/fellows.

**Conferences**

- The Academy of American Franciscan History and the Franciscan School of Theology are hosting a conference on The Franciscan Family in the New World, 1524-2000. The conference will take place November 3-4, in Oakland, California. For further information contact: Dr. John F. Schawaller; Office of the Provost; The University of Montana; 32 Campus Dr., #3324; Missoula, MT 59812. E-mail: <schwallr@selway.umt.edu>.

- The Humanities Research Group of the University of Windsor announces its 2000-01 Distinguished Speakers Series, entitled Urban Places, Urban Pleasures: The Cultural Use of Civic Space. Two presentations have been scheduled for fall 2000: on October 13, Daphne Spain, University of Virginia, will speak on “Redemptive Places and Civic Life”; and on November 17, Peter Baldwin, DePaul University, will speak on “Glimpsing the Darker Side: Children in American Streets at Night, 1880-1930.” For further information, contact: Humanities Research Group; University of Windsor; 430 Sunset Avenue; Windsor, Ontario N9B 3P4. Web site: www.uwindsor.ca/research/hrg.

**Recent Research**

- Francis Assisi Kennedy, O.S.F., requests contact from anyone knowing the location of correspondence by Rev. John Stephen Raffeiner, vicar general for German Catholics in New York, 1845-1861. She may be reached at: P.O. Box 100; Oldenburg, IN 47036.

- Mary Roger Madden, S.P., is writing several articles for the New Catholic Encyclopedia, including entries on: Blessed Mother Theodore Guerin; the Sisters of Providence; Ritamary Bradley, S.F.C.C.; and the Sister Formation Movement.

- The Reverend Ernest E. Robinson announces the completion of his dissertation, “The Role of the Priest in Pre-Marriage Ministry in the Policies of the Northeastern American Dioceses,” at the Seminary of the Immaculate Conception. Researchers interested
in this topic may contact Father Robinson at St. Pius X Residence; Diocese of Rockville Centre; 1220 Front Street; Uniondale, NY 11553.

- Dana L. Robert, Boston University School of Theology, has recently completed the direction of a year of seminars on "Women and Twentieth-Century Missions." She is currently preparing the papers delivered at these seminars for publication in an edited collection. Contributors are Catholic and Protestant, with Catholic authors including: Mary Motte, F.M.M.; Angelyn Dries, O.S.F.; and Margaret Guider, O.S.F.

- Susan Ware and her staff have begun editorial work on the fifth volume of Notable American Women. All candidates for inclusion must have died before January 1, 2000. Between 500 and 600 women will be selected from among several thousand candidates. Editors will be commissioning biographical essays of each woman selected. Inquiries may be directed to Susan Ware; Schlesinger Library; Radcliff Institute; Harvard University; 10 Garden St.; Cambridge, MA 02138.

- Mary Jo Weaver is in charge of the Roman Catholic section of a new encyclopedia, edited by Rosemary Radford Ruether and Rosemary Skinner Keller, on the religious experience of women in North America. For further information on the project, contact Professor Weaver at Department of Religious Studies, Indiana University; Bloomington, IN 47405.

Persons

- Jean Richardson has recently joined the faculty of Buffalo State College. She is currently working on publishing her dissertation, a study of the Buffalo hospital of the Sisters of Charity from 1848 to 1900.

Cushwa Receives Papal Award

On Friday, September 8, Anna Jean Cushwa was honored with the title "Lady of St. Gregory," a papal award bestowed upon her by the Most Reverend Thomas J. Tobin, Bishop of Youngstown, Ohio in recognition of a life of exemplary service to the church and to her local community. Mrs. Cushwa, a close friend and benefactor of the Cushwa Center, is dedicated to enhancing the intellectual, civic and pastoral life of the American church.

A member of St. Columba Parish in Youngstown, Ohio, Anna Jean helped to establish the Bureau of Information for the Diocese of Youngstown and served as assistant director of the bureau for three years. As a member of several local synods, she helped develop five-year plans for the diocese. Currently, she serves as chair of the lectors for St. Columba Parish.

Mrs. Cushwa has also served on numerous community organizations, including the Youngstown City Board of Health, the Junior Guild of St. Elizabeth Hospital, and the founding board of Hospice of the Valley. Currently president of the Henry H. Stambaugh Auditorium Association, she is on the North Side Citizens Coalition and the Schools 2000 Committee. She was a charter member of Leadership Youngstown.

A graduate of Cornell University, Mrs. Cushwa initially pursued a career in journalism. As a reporter for the Youngstown Vindicator, she covered the dedication of St. Columba Cathedral and the appointment of the late Bishop James W. Malone. Anna Jean has continued to serve the Church through her writing; most recently, she prepared the 150th anniversary booklet for St. Columba Parish.

William Cushwa, Anna Jean's spouse, is the son of Charles and Margaret Hall Cushwa, the original benefactors of the Cushwa Center. Bill and Anna Jean have recently extended the family's generous support of the study of American Catholicism at Notre Dame by providing for the endowment of the Cushwa Center director's position. This extraordinary gift will enable the Cushwa Center to remain a national and international center of excellence in the study of Roman Catholicism.
Catholic teaching on social justice has existed in uneasy tension with the general American faith in capitalism. The church’s persistent, if at times muted, criticism of capitalism has not shaken the faith that most American Catholics share in capitalism as the best available means to the end of a more just society. Historians have explored the social roots of this faith in the Catholic ascent to the middle class in the years following World War II. The cultural and theological roots have been relatively unexamined.

Eugene McCarraher’s Christian Critics: Religion and the Impasse in Modern American Social Thought (Cornell University Press, 2000) performs much-needed exploratory surgery on the complex relationship between Christian theological reflection and corporate capitalism in 20th-century America. Faithful readers of Commonweal will recall McCarraher’s 1997 attack on “Starbucks Catholicism” and the flurry of reaction he stirred up with his reproof of a U.S. Catholic community lacking a prophetic edge, preferring a cup of over-roasted Starbucks coffee and its attendant corporate-capitalist dogma to the strong wine of the gospel and the preferential option for the poor. In Christian Critics, McCarraher explores the intellectual history of corporate Christianity by linking modern Anglo-American theological writing to developments in the history of consumer culture and psychotherapeutic understandings of the self. In the tradition of Christopher Lasch, McCarraher has produced a history of cultural criticism that stands as an original work of criticism in its own right.

The rub of the book is the way in which U.S. Christian intellectuals employed theological reflection throughout the 20th century to baptize, confirm and ordain the managers of corporate-capitalist institutions. McCarraher reads major developments in 20th century American religious history through the lens of the unholy alliance of Christian intellectuals and corporate capitalism. The efforts of Christian intellectuals to promote the managerial style of capitalism and encourage churches to mimic capitalist management structures bore its bureaucratic fruit with the rise of the National Catholic Welfare Conference, the World Council of Churches, and the National Council of Churches. The eagerness to adopt consumerist conceptions of ministry based upon capitalist models of consumption reached its high point with Bishop Fulton J. Sheen, whose foray into television-entertainment triumphed in the ratings over the comedic artistry of Milton Berle. Leading thinkers such as John Courtney Murray, S.J., and Reinhold Niebuhr drank with and enjoyed the favor of corporate capitalism’s magnates — and for their reward graced the cover of Henry Luce’s Time magazine.

In these and a myriad of other ways, Christian thinkers appear as the prince-consorts of capitalism, all the while validating and enshrining “the system.” Where historian David Hollinger has argued for the important role that Jewish intellectuals played in the “dechristianization” of U.S. intellectual life, McCarraher joins the camp of historians George Marsden and James Turner by implicating the Christians themselves in the increasing secularization of public discourse.

The historical roots of capitalism’s seduction of religion lay in the Progressive era. According to McCarraher, the dazzling prospects of the managed society taking shape during the Great War led religious thinkers to see in the impersonal syncopation of Fordism and Taylorism a vision of the peaceable kingdom of well-regulated justice. In the age of Roosevelt, the CIO, led and peopled mostly by ethnic Catholics who had the cultural and philosophical resources to mount a resistance to capitalism’s domination, spurned worker-control schemes and a broader social justice agenda in favor of a bread-and-butter unionism based on capitalist-driven consumption. The truly radical possibilities of the 1960s founded in the “secular city,” where materialist revolution trumped radical spiritual conversion and the pursuit of political justice too often precluded the religious values of mercy and grace.

Within these broad socio-economic transformations, McCarraher sees a more intimate story of how Christian thinkers drew on the values of consumerism at the core of corporate-capitalist culture to transform the meanings of “therapy” and “self.” Traditionally, therapy referred to the church’s transformative efforts to make the individual into a more brilliant reflection of God’s likeness; to this end, the church encouraged constant vigilance against sinful human nature. Early in the century, Christian therapy gradually began to take on many of the trappings of the psychologizing secular culture; by the 1940s, many seminaries had begun to require courses in psychology and pastoral counseling. Whereas therapy once meant transformation, now it increasingly meant exploring the roots of one’s bad feelings and tendencies to hurt others; as therapy once implied an acknowledgment of sin and guilt, now it meant reminding people that life is worth living and that the Lord has given us a talisman of “Be-Happy Attitudes.”

McCarraher relates this transformation in the understanding of therapy to the role of Christian intellectuals in
promoting a consumer-based understanding of the human person. Liberalism's philosophers had for centuries promoted a vision of the human person as a bundle of desires calling out for fulfillment, but churches in the Catholic, Lutheran and Calvinist traditions historically resisted this understanding. Seduced by the culture of capitalism, Christian resistance often broke down in the 20th century. The theologian Paul Tillich, for example, came to see his obsessive lasciviousness as a lifelong experiment in spirituality. This type of theological reorientation laid the foundation for the make-your-own-sundae mentality in contemporary religion: To meet my spiritual needs, I'll borrow Passover from Judaism, yoga from the Eastern religions, Mary from the Catholics, crystals from California, etc.

Still, McCarracher presents the Christian encounter with capitalism as both diverse and contradictory. Readers will find a theologian espousing one set of ideas on one page and his intellectual kin calling for the seeming opposite on the next. But McCarracher also shows how Catholics, Protestants and their secular interlocutors often drew from the same intellectual sources in formulating their social criticisms. John A. Ryan studied and utilized John Dewey's pragmatism. Like Henry Adams before him, Randolph Bourne drank from the wells of Catholic medievalism. Dorothy Day and Reinhold Niebuhr appropriated the atheist Marx to the very different respective ends of Christian pacifism and Christian realism. Harvey Cox and Thomas Merton both turned East for enlightenment in the 1960s. Entangling alliances, some of which are surprising, are in no short supply here.

What of the "impasse" in social thought that McCarracher announces in his subtitle? In the same way that Christian thinkers mirrored secular culture by promoting new understandings of therapy and the self, in the 1960s and 1970s they also promoted the style of identity politics and "rights talk" that Jean Elshtain, Mary Ann Glendon and others have lately identified as the culprit in the impoverishment of U.S. democracy. The rise of gendered, ethnic and racial theologies that speak the language of liberation — often a very particularized liberation for a very particular group — has both mirrored and promoted the splintering of social and political discourse at large. The result: a hornets nest of interest groups buzzing about in pursuit of power, with power being the only desirable commodity in the political marketplace. The ensuing inability to form broad coalitions based on a "common good" is the impasse McCarracher thinks we need to get beyond.

In this book as in life, there are few unqualified heroes. There are, however, many partial heroes. For McCarracher, figures such as Vida Scudder, Richard Niebuhr, Dorothy Day and Martin Luther King Jr. prove exemplary. These activist intellectuals were able to retain a keen sense of the sentiments and needs of ordinary folk while employing the prophetic religious injunctions to humility, forgiveness and love as an antidote to the accumulating hubris of corporate capitalism. While their fellow believing intellectuals were capitalism's promoters, McCarracher's heroes prophetically called attention to the pink elephant in the room, illuminating capitalism's glaring inadequacies. Additionally, he nods to the Garry Wills of Bare Ruined Choir (1972) and the still-young "radical orthodoxy" movement in Christian social thought led by British social theorist John Milbank as authentic critical voices in a decentered world characterized by declining respect for tradition, interest group politics and sub-disciplinar intellectual chaos.

In the end, McCarracher's subjects — sometimes wittingly, sometimes unwittingly — bolstered corporate-capitalist culture and thus helped sustain corporate-capitalist society. Max Weber would probably take some satisfaction in reading McCarracher's book, for here is further evidence for his thesis that the creation and promotion of capitalism has been, in good measure at least, the work of religious people employing the rhetoric of religion.

It is unfortunate that this book is decidedly unsuited to the average undergraduate classroom, as it assumes a level of historical and philosophical knowledge that is present only among the most advanced college students. Graduate students and teachers of young people, however, would do well to study this book and deliver to their students at least some of the many gifts McCarracher here offers — not least among which is an invitation to see intellectual life, social criticism, and the qualities of humility and love as rightly and intimately connected.

Tempered and frustrated by the failures and delusions of past Christian thinkers, McCarracher nonetheless points hopefully to the potential of Christian social criticism in the effort to redress capitalism's failures, waxing eloquent about the possible contributions to be made in matters of public import by rigorous, critical, theological discourse. For as St. Peter reminds us, believers benefit from a "faith more precious than gold," which will cause them to "re-dound in praise and glory and honor at the coming of Jesus Christ." In the meantime, McCarracher proffers, such faith gives them a positive advantage in the public square of the City of Man.

— James P. McCartin
University of Notre Dame
Kimberly Vanesveld Adams, *Our Lady of Victorian Feminism: The Madonna in the Work of Anna Jameson, Margaret Fuller, and George Eliot* (Ohio University Press, 2000). This book examines the lives and works of three 19th-century Protestant feminist women crucially linked by their extensive use of the Madonna in arguments designed to empower women. Adams shows that Jameson, Fuller and Eliot moved beyond the customary identification of the Christian Madonna with the Victorian feminine ideal, freely appropriating the images of independent, powerful and wise virgin mothers, and making extensive use of the Madonna in feminist arguments. In addition to her literary, art historical and religious concerns, Adams emphasizes the connections between the intellectuals and the activists of the 19th-century women's movement. The book also addresses an often neglected strain of feminist thought, essentialist feminism, which proclaimed sexual equality as well as difference. This brand of feminism enabled the three writers to make one of their most radical arguments — that women and men are made in the image of the virgin mother and the son, the two faces of the divine.

Yaakov Ariel, *Evangelizing the Chosen People: Missions to the Jews in America, 1880–2000* (University of North Carolina Press, 2000), offers the first comprehensive history of Protestant evangelization of Jews in America to the present day. Based on unprecedented research in missionary archives as well as Jewish writings, the book analyzes the theology and activities of both the missions and the converts and describes the reactions of the Jewish community, which in turn helped to shape the evangelical activity directed toward it. Ariel delineates three successive waves of evangelism, the first directed toward poor Jewish immigrants, the second toward American-born Jews trying to assimilate, and the third toward Jewish baby boomers influenced by the counterculture of the Vietnam War era. After World War II, the missionary impulse became almost exclusively the realm of conservative evangelicals, as the more liberal segments of American Christianity took the path of interfaith dialogue. As Ariel shows, these missionary efforts have profoundly influenced Christian-Jewish relations. Jews have seen the missionary movement as a continuation of attempts to delegitimize Judaism and to do away with Jews through assimilation or annihilation. But to conservative evangelical Christians, who support the State of Israel, evangelizing Jews is a manifestation of goodwill.

Jon Butler, *Becoming America: The Revolution Before 1776* (Harvard University Press, 2000). A panoramic view of the colonies from 1680 to the eve of the revolution. Butler portrays the America of this era as multinational, profit-driven, materialistic, politically self-conscious, power-hungry, religiously plural — in short, an America strikingly modern in character. Stressing the middle and late decades of the American colonial experience and emphasizing the importance of the middle and southern colonies as well as New England, Butler sees the colonial world prior to 1776 in terms of revolutionary social change within a polyglot population of English, Indians, Africans, Scots, Germans, Swiss and French. Butler depicts settlers pursuing sophisticated provincial politics that ultimately sparked revolution and a new nation; developing new patterns in production, consumption, crafts and trades that remade commerce at home and abroad; and fashioning a society remarkably pluralistic in religion, whose tolerance nonetheless did not extend to Africans or Indians. Ultimately, Butler argues that for 90 years before 1776, colonial society was already becoming America.

David Carrasco, *City of Sacrifice: The Aztec Empire and the Role of Violence in Civilization* (Beacon Press, 2000), confronts fiercely provocative questions about violence and civilization through an innovative history of the Aztecs. Carrasco chronicles the story of Tenochtitlan, the Aztec capital. Investigating Aztec religious practices, he demonstrates that ritual violence was integral to urbanization: In effect, the city itself was a temple to the gods. If violence against humans was a profound necessity for the Aztecs in their capital city, is it central to the construction of social order and the authority of city-states? Is civilization built on violence? Carrasco examines not only the rich history of a major Mesoamerican city but also the inseparability of two passionate human impulses: urbanization and religious engagement. His findings have important implications for our understanding of recent events from suicide bombings in Tel Aviv to violence in the Balkans.

Ram A. Cnaan with Robert J. Wineburg and Stephanie C. Boddie, *The Newer Deal: Social Work and Religion in Partnership* (Columbia University Press, 1999). As the federal system of entitlements and social services long provided by New Deal-era programs is dismantled and shifted to the states, the religious community finds itself relied upon more than ever to assist with social services for the needy. This book calls upon religious-based organizations and the social work/social service community to put aside their differences and forge a "limited partnership" to provide the social and welfare services on which millions depend. The proposed partnership focuses on maintaining the traditional values of each side of the partnership while providing joint care for those in need — with particular attention to services for people of color, gays and lesbians, women, and programs for community empowerment and economic development. The authors discuss different types of religious-based social services and draw on case examples and research findings to show how the religious community’s role in providing social services is stronger than ever.

Etan Diamond, *And I Will Dwell in Their Midst: Orthodox Jews in Suburbia* (University of North Carolina Press, 2000). Although rarely associated with postwar suburbia, Orthodox Jews in metropolitan areas across the United States and Canada have successfully combined suburban lifestyles and the
culture of consumerism with a strong sense of religious traditionalism and community cohesion. Diamond argues that their very presence in suburbia, Orthodox Jewish communities challenge dominant assumptions about society and religious culture in the 20th century. Using the history of Orthodox Jewish suburbanization in Toronto, Diamond explores the different components of the North American suburban Orthodox Jewish community: sacred spaces, synagogues, schools, kosher homes and social networks. In a larger sense, though, his book tells a story of how traditionalist religious communities have thrived in the most secular of environments.

E. J. Dionne Jr. and John J. Dilulio Jr., eds., *What's God Got to do with the American Experiment?* (Brookings Institution Press, 2000). This collection of essays explores the unsettled — and often unsettling — question of the role of organized religion in American political life. Richard N. Ostling reviews religious belief and practice in the United States in a survey of the ever-changing religious landscape, while Robert J. Blendon and others compare the political, moral and religious values of the 1960s with those of the 1990s.

Patrick Glynn and Alan Wolfe examine different religious responses to the recent presidential scandal, and James Q. Wilson, John J. Dilulio Jr. and Ram Cnaan examine the rise of faith-based social programs, including the shift of private funds to social service providers, the role of black churches in the inner city, and social and community work by urban religious congregations. Additional contributors include Taylor Branch, Kurt Schmoke, Cal Thomas and Peter Wehnner.

James J. Divita, *Splendor of the South Side: A History of Sacred Heart of Jesus Catholic Parish in Indianapolis, 1875-2000* (Sacred Heart Church, 2000). Divita, a former president of the Indiana Religious History Association, tells the 125-year history of a parish founded by Franciscan priests expelled from Germany during the years of Bismark's

*Kulturkampf*. He explores the parish history through a wide variety of topics, including the parish's original commitment to the German language, its tradition of choral music and fine theater productions, Catholic education and sports, the mistreatment of German-Americans during World War I and pre-Vatican II spirituality. The book features numerous colorful photographs of the church interior, as well as more than 80 historic photographs to illustrate parish life over the past 125 years. Copies are available for $35 (postage and handling included), from: Sacred Heart Church, Box Order; 1530 Union Street; Indianapolis, IN 46225. Make checks payable to "Sacred Heart Church."

Louis Dupré, *Symbols of the Sacred* (Eerdman's, 2000), gathers four classic essays on the role of symbols in our understanding of the sacred and on their fundamental importance to religious consciousness. Dupré discusses the nature of religious symbols, the importance of language for capturing symbolic meaning, the ancient link between art and expressions of the sacred, and the vital relationship between religious symbol and myth. The book concludes with a reflection on the innate capacity of human minds to grasp the transcendent.

Robert William Fogel, *The Fourth Great Awakening and the Future of Egalitarianism* (University of Chicago Press, 1999). Surveying the growing conservatism and religious revivalism of today's United States, Nobel Prize-winning economist Robert Fogel sees America in the midst of its "fourth Great Awakening." Fogel looks to the nation's past to discover the strong link between technologically induced cycles of religiousness — or "awakenings" — in American history and attitudes toward poverty, education and social equality. He sees the United States' "fourth Great Awakening" propelled by the tendency of technological advances to outpace ethical norms. The first Great Awakening, which began in 1730, laid the ideological foundation for the American Revolution. The second, starting in 1800, introduced many daring reforms, including the abolition of slavery. The third awakening, from 1890 to 1930, emphasized social injustice and launched the welfare state. America's new awakening, which began in the late 1950s, promotes a zealous new movement focused on spiritual rather than material reforms. Liberals, argues Fogel, have misunderstood the appeal of the religious right. The intractable forms of inequality today are not in the distribution of food, clothing and shelter, as they were a century ago, but in the distribution of immaterial or "spiritual" assets, which economists call "knowledgeable capital." Fogel's optimistic study describes 15 of these assets, vital to both economic success and the good life, and presents a new program of egalitarian reforms based on shared values of liberals and conservatives and the distribution of these assets.

Jean Fournée, *Praying the Angelus* (Crossroad, 2000), reflects on the prayer that serves to organize the daily spiritual life of Europe for almost 1,000 years. Three times a day, the Angels bells would ring and the entire community would recite a prayer in memory of God becoming human in Jesus Christ. This book presents the text of the actual Angelus prayer, and examines the spiritual, biblical and historical basis for this custom of traditional Catholic life. Written for people coming to the prayer for the first time, this book also offers insights for those wishing to refresh their connection to it.

Craig James Hazen, *The Village Enlightenment in America: Popular Religion and Science in the Nineteenth Century* (University of Illinois Press, 2000), examines the lives and work of three 19th-century spiritual activists at a time when science and religion appeared entirely reconcilable. A theologian, writer and apologist for the nascent Mormon movement, as well as an amateur scientist, Orson Pratt wrote *Key to the Universe*; or, *A New Theory of Its Mechanism* to establish a scientific basis for the Church of Jesus Christ of Latter-day Saints. Robert Hare, an inventor and ardent convert to spiritualism, used his scientific expertise to lend credence
to the spiritualist movement. Phineas Parkhurst Quimby, generally considered the initiator of the American mind-cure movement, developed an overtly religious concept of science and used it to justify his system of theology. Pratt, Hare and Quimby all employed a potent combination of popular science and Baconianism to legitimate their new religious ideas. Using the same terms — matter, ether, magnetic force — to account for the behavior of particles, planetary rotation, and the influence of the Holy Ghost, these agents of the Enlightenment constructed complex systems intended to demonstrate a fundamental harmony between the physical and the metaphysical.

Albert Holtz, O.S.B., *Downtown Monks: Sketches of God in the City* (Ave Maria Press, 2000). This book tells the story of a Benedictine monastery that has thrived in downtown Newark, New Jersey, for the past 150 years. Wearing traditional robes and devoted to a traditional Benedictine life of prayer, the monks of Newark have nonetheless rejected the cloistered life in favor of active engagement in the life of the city. Holtz, a member of the community for over 30 years, tells the story of these monks through a series of brief vignettes reflecting on issues such as the frustration of an inner-city high school student, the faith of a single mother and the power of hope.

Mark D. Jordan, *The Silence of Sodom: Homosexuality in Modern Catholicism* (University of Chicago Press, 2000). Sexual scandals in the Roman Catholic Church have been highly public in recent years, and the Vatican has continued to affirm the church’s traditional opposition to homosexual practice. Jordan takes up the fundamental question of the relationship between male homosexuality and Catholicism. The complex bureaucratic language of the Church’s teaching about sexual morality has worked to produce silence around the topic of male homoeroticism. Arguing that we cannot find the Church’s knowledge of homosexuality in its documents, Jordan looks to the unspoken but widely known features of clerical culture to illuminate the striking analogies between clerical institutions and contemporary gay culture, particularly in the mechanisms of discipline, the training of seminarians and the ambiguities of liturgical celebration.

Barbara Kreiger (with Shalom Goldman), *Divine Expectations: An American Woman in Nineteenth-Century Palestine* (Ohio University Press, 2000), presents the account of Clarinda Minor, a charismatic American Christian woman whose belief in the second coming prompted her to leave a comfortable life in Philadelphia in 1851 and take up agriculture in Palestine. After her disappointment in a failed prophecy that the end of days would take place in October 1844, Mrs. Minor determined that the Holy Land was not yet adequately prepared for such an event and decided that it would be her mission to teach the poverty-stricken Jews of Palestine to work the soil. Despite the distinctly religious nature of her mission, Minor worked to bring social unity across confessional lines, establishing a small farm where Christians, Muslims and Jews labored alongside one another.

Jaroslav Kupczak, O.P., *Destined for Liberty: The Human Person in the Philosophy of Karol Wojtyla/John Paul II* (Catholic University Press of America, 2000), offers a complete introduction to John Paul II’s theory of the human person. Kupczak traces the development of Karol Wojtyla’s theology from his earlier and lesser-known writings — *The Habilitation Thesis* and *Lublin Lectures* — to his more popular writings — *Love and Responsibility* and *The Acting Person*. He examines Wojtyla’s moral theory in relation to its main sources in the mystical theology of St. John of the Cross, the thought of St. Thomas Aquinas and the phenomenology of Max Scheler. Given access to original Polish texts, most of which are still not available in English, Kupczak provides a missing link between the current moral teaching of John Paul II and the early stages of his intellectual career. Topics covered include ethical values and human freedom, the relation between freedom and truth, the conscience and consciousness, the human body, and the process of human cognition.

Lowell Livezey, ed., *Public Religion and Urban Transformation: Faith in the City* (New York University Press, 2000). The de-industrialization of large, aging cities has been enormously disruptive for urban communities. This book examines the important but often overlooked role of religious organizations in the cultural and political restructuring of the modern metropolis. Revisiting the primary site of research for the early members of the Chicago School of Urban Sociology, the volume focuses on Chicago. Drawing on a massive study of over 75 congregations in urban neighborhoods, the essays collected in this volume present urban religion in its full range of diversity, from the churches of a Mexican-American neighborhood and the Black middle class to communities shared by Jews, Christians, Hindus, and Muslims to the rise of “megachurches.” Essays include: Peter R. D’Agostino, “Catholic Planning for a Multicultural Metropolis, 1982-1996,” and Elfriede Wedam, “Catholic Spirituality in a New Urban Church.”

Joanna Manning, *Is the Pope Catholic? A Woman Confronts Her Church* (Crossroad, 2000). An outspoken advocate for women’s equality, Manning argues that John Paul II’s current views on women are not only a problem for the Catholic Church, but also a threat to the well-being of all women, regardless of belief. Manning presents the full range of John Paul’s activities, from his renewed ban on women priests to the Vatican’s interventions at United Nations conferences, as a reversal of women’s progress toward equality that has bitterly divided Catholics and undermined the Church’s credibility.

Philip J. Murnion, ed., *Church Authority in American Culture: The Second Cardinal Bernardin Conference* (Crossroad, 1999), includes the full text of four papers presented at the second Cardinal Bernardin Conference, as well as a record of discussions with the panelists. In his paper, “Humanae Vitae and Ordinatio Sacerdotiae: Problems of Reception,” Avery Dulles reviews the Church’s teaching on artificial contraception and the ordination of women, examining the exercise of papal authority in both instances. Other essays
include “Authority and its Exercise” by Joseph A. Komonchak, “Church Authority in American Culture: Cases and Observations” by James A. Condon and “Authority in America” by Philip Selznick.


Mark Noll, *Protestants in America* (Oxford University Press, 2000). A comprehensive history of American Protestants focusing on denominational, regional, and ethnic diversity from the first English colony at Jamestown to the present day. Noll examines the direct impact of Protestants on events in American history such as the American Revolution and World War I. He covers Protestant involvement in critical issues from temperance to the civil rights movement, and provides profiles of leading Protestants, from Jonathan Edwards and Phillips Wheatly to Billy Graham and Martin Luther King Jr.

Oliver O’Donovan and Joan Lockwood O’Donovan, eds., *From Irenaeus to Grotius: A Sourcebook in Christian Political Thought* (William B. Eerdmans, 1999). A reference tool for scholars, teachers and students from a wide range of disciplines, this volume illustrates the use of Christian theological arguments in political discussion from the patristic age to the early modern period. For a millennium and a half, the appeal to the authority of the biblical texts and the biblical themes of creation, the fall, Christology, the church and eschatology established the parameters of political debate. This collection provides access to these strands of theopolitical argument, gathering primary sources from more than 65 authors together with introductory essays that discuss each thinker’s contribution to the tradition of Christian political thought.

Jerome Oetgen, *Mission to America: A History of Saint Vincent Archabboty, the First Benedictine Monastery in the United States* (Catholic University of America Press, 2000), chronicles the founding of the first Benedictine monastery in the United States and the broader development of monastic life in America. Oetgen traces the history of the monastery, parish, seminary, college, prep school and scholasticate in Latrobe, Pennsylvania, from the founding of the Sportsman’s Hall parish in 1790 to the election of Rembert Weakland as the seventh archbishop in 1963. Using American and European archival sources, as well as documents and letters in Saint Vincent records, Oetgen fills a significant gap in American Benedictine history.

John O’Malley, *Trent and All That: Renaming Catholicism in the Early Modern Era* (Harvard University Press, 2000). Catholicism in the early modern era goes by many names, including Counter Reformation, Catholic Reformation, the Baroque Age, the Tridentine Age, and the Confessional Age. O’Malley examines the political, religious and cultural prejudices behind the development of these labels in the 19th and 20th centuries. He argues for Early Modern Catholicism as the most appropriate label for this period and insists that Early Modern Catholicism must be understood as one aspect of the broader history of early modern Europe.

Diarmuid O’Murchu, *Our World in Transition: Making Sense of a Changing World* (Crossroad, 2000), examines the profound evolutionary changes that are taking place in the contemporary world. O’Murchu argues that recent years have seen a major re-visioning of the place of man in creation. The mechanistic model developed during the Enlightenment and Industrial Revolution has gradually shifted to a paradigm that embodies and comprehends the whole of existence. This new paradigm sees the whole as being more than the sum of its parts. O’Murchu examines the impact this radical new way of seeing is having in diverse areas from medicine and physics to international politics and religion.

Kelley A. Raab, *When Women Become Priests: The Catholic Women’s Ordination Debate* (Columbia University Press, 2000). Unlike previous works that have argued for the ordination of women, this book offers the first sustained reflection on the differences that would be obtained with women at the altar. Combining feminist criticism, psychoanalysis and Catholic theology, Raab explores the symbolic implications of women at the altar, providing insight into issues of gender, symbolism and power. She addresses critical issues about the potential effects of a female priesthood on parishioners, on the sacrament of communion and on the significance of the symbolism of Jesus that priests maintain during certain ceremonies. Supported by interviews with women in the Episcopal priesthood (which has ordained women since 1977), Raab draws upon object-relations theory, Freudian concepts of the unconscious, and French feminist thinkers Julia Kristeva and Luce Irigaray to show how the celebration of Mass by women priests would require a constructive re-envisioning of core dimensions of Catholic theology.

Clara Rodriguez, *Changing Race: Latinos, the Census and the History of Ethnicity* (New York University Press, 2000). Latinos are the fastest growing population group in the United States. Through their language and popular music, Latinos continue to make their mark on America and are becoming more assertive and less content to remain America’s “second minority.” How then do they fit in to America’s divided racial landscape and how do they define their own racial and ethnic identity? Are they just another American ethnic group, like Italians or Germans, that will assimilate into English-speaking America? Or will they maintain a distinct Spanish-speaking culture for generations to come? Can this diverse group, made up of dozens of separate nationalities, even be considered a single “race?” Can they help bridge the gap between black and white Americans? Through extensive personal interviews and careful analysis of census data, Clara Rodriguez shows that Latino identity is surprisingly fluid, situation-dependent
and constantly changing. She illustrates how the way Latinos are defining themselves, and refusing to define themselves, represents a powerful challenge to America’s system of racial classification.

Leonard Rogoff, *Homelands: Southern-Jewish Identity in Durham and Chapel Hill, North Carolina* (University of Alabama Press, 2000). Blending oral history, documentary studies, and quantitative research, this book provides a case study of a unique ethnic group in North America — small-town southern Jews. Both Jews and southerners have long struggled with questions of identity and whether to retain their differences or try to assimilate into the national culture. Rogoff shows how, as immigrant Jews became small-town southerners, they constantly renegotiated their identities and reinvented their histories. The Durham-Chapel Hill Jewish community was formed during the 1880s and 1890s, when the South was recovering from the Reconstruction era and Jews were experiencing ever-growing immigration as well as challenging the religious traditionalism of the previous 4,000 years. Recent arrivals from the traditional societies of eastern Europe, Durham and Chapel Hill Jews assimilated and secularized as they lessened their differences with other Americans. Some Jews assimilated through intermarriage and conversion, but the trajectory of the community as a whole was toward retaining their religious and ethnic differences while attempting to integrate with their neighbors. The Durham-Chapel Hill area is uniquely suited to the study of the southern Jewish experience, Rogoff maintains, because the region is exemplary of two major trends: the national population movement southward and the rise of Jews into the professions. The Jewish peddler and storekeeper of the 1880s and the doctor and professor of the 1990s, Rogoff argues, are representative figures of both Jewish upward mobility and southern progress.

Robert Royal, *The Catholic Martyrs of the Twentieth Century: A Comprehensive World History* (Crossroad, 2000), provides an extensive survey of 20th-century martyrs who have died in defense of their faith. In a sweeping account of religious persecutions throughout the world, the author de-

venge, Christian Smith, *Christian America?: What Evangelicals Really Want* (University of California Press, 2000), explores the beliefs, values, commitments and goals of the ordinary men and women who make up American evangelicalism. Based on data from a three-year national study, involving over 200 in-depth interviews of evangelicals, this book takes issue with the common stereotype of evangelicals as right-wing, intolerant religious zealots seeking to impose a Christian moral order through political force. Smith argues that evangelicals are a far more diverse and ambivalent than common stereotypes suggest, and insists that this diversity must become part of the larger discussion surrounding the basic identity of the United States as a pluralistic nation.

Lester D. Stephens, *Science, Race, and Religion in the American South: John Bachman and the Charleston Circle of Naturalists, 1815–1895* (University of North Carolina Press, 2000). In the decades before the Civil War, Charleston, South Carolina, enjoyed recognition as the center of scientific activity in the South. By 1850, the city boasted an excellent museum of natural history and only three other cities in the United States — Philadelphia, Boston and New York — exceeded Charleston in natural history studies. Examining the scientific activities and contributions of John Bachman, Edmund Ravenel, John Edwards Holbrook, Lewis R. Gibbes, Francis S. Holmes and John McCrady, Lester Stephens uncovers the important achievements of Charleston’s circle of naturalists in a region that has conventionally been dismissed as largely devoid of scientific interests. Stephens devotes particular attention to the special problems faced by the Charleston naturalists and to the ways in which their religious and racial beliefs interacted with and shaped their scientific pursuits. In the end, cultural commitments proved stronger than scientific principles. When the South seceded from the Union in 1861, the members of the Charleston circle placed regional patriotism above science and supported the Confederate cause. Stephens argues that the Charleston circle never fully recovered from the blow, and a century would elapse before the South took an equal role in the pursuit of mainstream scientific research.
Richard Stewart, *Leprosy Priest of Molokai: The Father Damien Story* (University of Hawaii Press, 2000), traces the life of Father Damien from his boyhood in rural Belgium to his death after 16 years of service at the leper settlement in Hawaii. In addition to his spiritual ministry, Father Damien served the lepers as a self-taught medical doctor and master builder of chapels, churches and houses. This biography presents and analyzes much new information about Damien and his years in Hawaii. The correspondence of Damien with his colleagues in the Catholic Church, his Protestant supporters and agents of the Hawaiian Board of Health gives a fuller understanding of the extent of Damien’s work at the settlement. These letters also reveal the tensions underlying his relations with Church bureaucrats who were impressed by his energy and zeal yet irritated by his willfulness and independence. Stewart concludes, however, that even Father Damien’s detractors could not deny that he was almost single-handedly responsible for tremendous improvements to the lives of the lepers he served.

William H. Swatos Jr. and James K. Wellman Jr., eds., *The Power of Religious Publics: Staking Claims in American Society* (Praeger, 1999), consists of 12 essays by noted historians and sociologists who explore complex issues of religion and the assertion of power in the public sphere. Martin Marty addresses the three major areas of concern: central to the essays in the volume: the interrelation of the concepts of “public” and “religion” in American society today; the kinds of power “religious publics” assert; and the validity of the notion of “the general public” in contrast to the concept of numberless “sub publics.” James R. Kelly, Fordham University, explores in detail the Catholic Common Ground Initiative, with specific reference to the abortion controversy and American Roman Catholicism. Contributors include Robert N. Bellah, Jacob Neusner, Peggy L. Shriver, James D. Davidson, James T. Richardson and Rhys H. Williams.

Richard Viladesau, *Theology and the Arts: Encountering God Through Music, Art and Rhetoric* (Paulist Press, 2000), explores several aspects of the relations between theology and aesthetics, in both the pastoral and academic realms. Viladesau writes of beauty as a means of divine revelation and art as the human mediation that both enables and limits beauty’s revelatory power. Using examples from music, pictorial art and rhetoric he explores different aspects of the ways that art and theology interact, both in pastoral practice (e.g., liturgical music, sacred art and preaching) and in systematic reflection. This work provides a discography of illustrative musical works and lists of Internet sites of sacred art and art history resources.

Msgr. Francis J. Weber, *Memories of an Old Country Priest* (Saint Francis Historical Society, 2000). This autobiography covers the life of Francis J. Weber from his childhood in Indiana during the 1930s through his adult life as a priest, writer, archivist and historian in California. Recounting his life in relation to the turbulent events of the 20th century, Weber writes as a priest happy in his vocation who is concerned to counter the negative images of priests so often promoted by sociologists and the mass media.

James Yerkes, ed., *John Updike and Religion: The Sense of the Sacred and the Motions of Grace* (William B. Eerdmans, 1999). Fifteen scholars examine the religious dimension of Updike’s oeuvre and offer analyses of his view of religion in 20th-century American culture. The essays address a range of topics, including Updike’s relation to his Lutheran roots, the theology of Karl Barth, race, the American Renaissance and homoeroticism. This collection includes a poem and an introductory essay on the subject by Updike himself.

Phyllis Zagano, *Holy Saturday: An Argument for the Restoration of the Female Diaconate in the Catholic Church* (Crossroad Publishing, 2000). Drawing on theological anthropology, sacramental theology, ecclesiology, historical and ecumenical sources, and contemporary understandings of the permanent diaconate, Zagano concludes that it is entirely within the Church’s power, authority and tradition to restore its practice of ordaining women to the diaconate. She shows the possibility of ordaining women to the permanent diaconate in the Catholic Church as a response from tradition that would permanently incorporate women into the teaching, sanctifying and governing roles of the Church.

Recent journal articles of interest include:


Allan Greer, “Colonial Saints: Gender, Race, and Hagiography in New France,” The William and Mary Quarterly 57, no. 2 (April 2000): 323-349.


Oded Heilbrunner, “From Ghetto to Ghetto: The Place of German Catholic Society in Recent Historiography,” The Journal of Modern History 72, no. 2 (June 2000): 453-495.


Darren E. Sherkat, “That They Be Keepers of the Home: The Effect of Conservative Religion on Early and Late Transitions into Housewifery,”


AMERICAN CATHOLIC STUDIES
NEWSLETTER

SUBSCRIPTIONS

☐ Two years — $12  ☐ Three years — $15
☐ Working Papers — $5 each (check titles below)

Total amount enclosed: $__________ ☐ new ☐ renewal
Please make check payable to the Cushwa Center. Mail to Cushwa Center for the Study of American Catholicism, University of Notre Dame, 1135 Flanner Hall, Notre Dame, Indiana 46556-3611.

Name __________________________________________
Address __________________________________________
City __________________________ State ________ Zip ________

Working Paper Series
☐ Christopher Vecsey, "Pueblo Indian Catholicism: The Isleta Case"—Fall 1996

☐ Kathleen M. Joyce, "Medicine, Markets and Morals: The Catholic Church and Therapeutic Abortion in Early 20th Century America" — Fall 1997


☐ Michael Novak, "Apologia Pro Vita Sua: The Debate About Incarnational Humanism" — Fall 1998

☐ Mary Lethert Wingerd, "Revisiting 'Great Man' History: How the Irish Captured the City of St. Paul" — Fall 1998

☐ Michele Dillon, "The Possibilities for a Pluralistic Catholicism" — Fall 1999


News Items for Newsletter
(Current position, research interests, etc.):
________________________________________________________________________
________________________________________________________________________
________________________________________________________________________
________________________________________________________________________
________________________________________________________________________
THE CUSHWA CENTER FOR THE STUDY OF AMERICAN CATHOLICISM

The Cushwa Center seeks to promote and encourage the scholarly study of the American Catholic tradition through instruction, research, publication and the collection of historical materials. Named for its benefactors, Charles and Margaret Hall Cushwa of Youngstown, Ohio, the center strives to deepen Catholics' understanding of the historical role and contemporary expressions of their religious tradition in the United States. The American Catholic Studies Newsletter is prepared by the staff of the Cushwa Center and published twice yearly. ISSN 1081-4019

Director: R. Scott Appleby
Assistant to the Director: Barbara Lockwood
Research Associate: Christopher Shannon
Publications Editor: Charlotte Ames

E-mail address: cushwa.1@nd.edu
URL: www.nd.edu/~cushwa

AMERICAN CATHOLIC STUDIES

NEWSLETTER

Cushwa Center for the Study of American Catholicism
University of Notre Dame
1135 Flanner Hall
Notre Dame, Indiana 46556-5611