Catholic Encounters in the American Century

Nuns draw on papal encyclicals and existential psychology to forge a rationale for civil rights activism — and a spiritual map for their pilgrimage from the convent to the streets of Selma. "Labor priests" translate "traditional" Catholic commitments — to fervent anti-communism and to the interests of the working class — into an endorsement of and energetic support for the fledgling Congress of Industrial Organizations (CIO). The public rituals of Latino popular Catholicism, heralding a striking new presence on the U.S. cultural and religious stage, transform the crucifixion of communal suffering into the resurrection of communal solidarity. Euro-American Catholics crowd the confessionals until the mid-1960s, when the decline in practice is both instantaneous and precipitous.

Charting the trajectory of such developments, and attempting to provide plausible accounts and explanations of them, was the challenge facing the approximately one hundred students and scholars of American religion who gathered at Notre Dame from March 9 to March 11 to participate in the culminating conference of the Cushwa Center’s “Catholicism in Twentieth-Century America” project. The three-year research initiative, funded by the Lilly Endowment and the University of Notre Dame, provided a forum for scholars to share their original research exploring the connections between the history of the Catholic community and of American society as a whole in the 20th century. The diversity and quality of the presentations left participants with a sense of a new level of sophistication in the study of American Catholicism, and excitement for the possibilities for future development in the field.

If an overarching theme emerged from the 41 presentations (based primarily on book or dissertation chapters in progress) by faculty and graduate students from colleges and universities across the country, it was “the consequences of interaction”: among nuns, civil rights workers and black families; between Mexican Catholics and U.S. prelates; between traditional sacramental practices and currents of institutional reform; between the ethnic politics of the New Jersey waterfront and the social justice teachings of papal encyclicals; between a brilliant Jewish neighborhood political organizer and the Catholic priests who became his disciples; between newly suburbanized postwar Catholics and their Protestant and Jewish neighbors and colleagues in business and the professions.

Was the price of these varied interactions an erosion of the ethnic and religious particularity that had set Catholics apart from “mainstream” Americans prior to World War I? Did secularization, American-style, foster an attitude of “religious indifferentism” that gradually undermined the reception of Catholic doctrine by the faithful — a fate predicted by worried Catholic University of America priest-scholars writing at mid-century? Did the Second Vatican Council reinforce and deepen American Catholic identity, or accelerate the process of cultural assimilation into an amorphous and religiously casual American society? Do first- and second-generation Latino Americans, tenacious in their devotion to the family as the

---

**Cushwa Center Activities** ................................................................. 2–5

**Announcements** ................................................................. 11–12

**Publications:** The Abduction of Catholic History .................. 12–22

---

*see Catholic Encounters, page 5*
CUSHWA CENTER ACTIVITIES

Lecture: Integrating Catholic History and American History

On Thursday, March 9, in conjunction with the conference on "Catholicism in Twentieth-Century America," Kathryn Kish Sklar delivered a talk on "Integrating Catholic-American History and American History." Author of the award-winning books Catherine Beecher: A Study in American Domesticity and Florence Kelley and the Nation's Work: The Rise of Women's Political Culture, 1830-1900, Sklar is distinguished professor of history at the State University of New York at Binghamton. She serves on the Steering Committee of the Catholic Women working group of the Twentieth-Century Project.

America has been dominated by a fundamentally Protestant, providential view of America's special role in world history. Sklar argued that the end of the cold war has called this narrative into question, and exciting developments in the field of Catholic history suggest the potential of new narratives to shape our understanding of American history.

Sklar acknowledged that, until recently, American history and Catholic history have indeed seemed to flow in separate streams. The mainstream of American history was determined early on by the dominance of the New England cultural diaspora that spread across the old Northwest Territory in the middle decades of the 19th century. The descendants of Puritans established a broad network of cultural institutions — with the school at its center — that perpetuated a particularly New England ideal of America as a "Shining City on a Hill" even as it incorporated an increasingly diverse populace. Officially secular but culturally Protestant, this idealized view of American history had little room for Catholics beyond occasional cameo appearances.

Catholics, for their part, cultivated the notion of a "distinctive tradition" of American Catholicism — distinct both in comparison to European Catholicism, and as a minority or outsider tradition within America. This understanding of Catholic history found its first major institutional expression in 1915, when Peter Guilday founded the Catholic Historical Review at the Catholic University of America. Under the leadership of Thomas T. McAvoy, C.S.C., at the University of Notre Dame, this style of Catholic history flourished during the 1940s and 1950s.

In the years following Vatican II, the role of the laity increased in historiographic importance, and scholars such as Jay Dolan and Philip Gleason brought the field to a new level of sophistication by focusing on the process of Americanization in the social and intellectual life of Catholics. With the establishment of a separate Catholic history accomplished, Catholic scholars moved on to new fields of specialization in the 1980s. Greater attention to the issue of gender, a focus on parish and archdiocesan boundaries as markers of a distinct public space, and innovative approaches to traditional Catholic devotional life have since enabled scholars of Catholicism to engage new developments within mainstream American history writing.

Sklar compared the development of Catholic history with that of her own primary field. Women's history grew during the 1970s in part because of the cultivation of a separate identity and the establishment of distinct institutional outlets for new scholarship, such as the Berkshire Conference in Women's History. By the 1980s, some 60 graduate programs offered concentrations in U.S. women's history, and by the 1990s a substantial portion of the larger scholarly community was coming to see U.S. history as woman's history.

Sklar regretted that American Catholic history, however, is still far from this point in its relation to mainstream U.S. history. Despite a substantial body of quality work, the field of Catholic history has yet to achieve due recognition by the profession as a whole. Sklar noted that little has changed since Leslie Tenter raised this issue in her seminal 1990 American Quarterly article, "On the Margins: The State of American Catholic History." In her own field of women's history, Sklar noted that Catholic and Protestant women continue to occupy separate historiographical worlds. She recounted a personal incident in which she and Mary Oates attempted to bridge this gap at a women's history conference, only to be told "We have something on nuns." Sklar commented that the conference organizers apparently failed to see any difference between the paper on 13th-century European nuns already on the schedule, and the paper on 20th-century American nuns that she and Oates were proposing.

Professor Sklar concluded by insisting on the need to counter this professional resistance through the force of good scholarship. The "Catholicism in Twentieth-Century America" project provides a model for the kind of history that needs to be produced in order to...
challenge this resistance. American history looks different after the work on women, ethnicity, popular culture, social activism, and labor that the Cushwa Center has sponsored over the last three years. With the fading of older master narratives of "America," Catholic history stands poised to take the lead in restructuring the discipline of American history as a whole.

**Lecture: Neither American nor Catholic?**

On the evening of Friday, March 10, Roberto S. Goizueta concluded the first day of the conference on "Catholicism in Twentieth-Century America" with a public lecture on "American Catholicism at the Dawn of the Twenty-First Century: Neither American nor Catholic?" The author of *Caminos Con Jesús: Toward a Hispanic/Latino Theology of Accompaniment*, Goizueta is professor of theology at Boston College and a member of the Latino Popular Catholicism working group. Jay Dolan, professor of history at Notre Dame and founder of the Cushwa Center, provided the introduction.

Roberto S. Goizueta

In his opening remarks, Goizueta cited Pope John Paul II's challenge to Catholics to confront the increasingly diverse and transnational character of the American church. By numbers alone, Latino Catholics, soon to be a majority within the church of the United States, command attention. At a deeper level, Goizueta argued, Latino popular Catholicism offers the possibility of realizing the best ideals of "America," as set forth in the Declaration of Independence, and of recovering aspects of the Catholic tradition supportive of human liberation.

A distinctive history stands behind "the Latino difference." Latin American Catholicism grew out of Iberian medieval and baroque Christianity, while the Catholicism of the institutional church in the United States grew out of the increasingly rationalistic, post-Tridentine Roman Catholicism of northern Europe. The pre-modern elements of Iberian Catholicism were further reinforced and transformed through interaction with indigenous, Amerindian cultures, while Catholicism in the English colonies reinforced its rationalist tendencies by refusing to intermingle with indigenous cultures.

Drawing on the work of Orlando Espin and Mark Francis, Goizueta argued that these two strains of Catholicism entailed fundamentally different approaches to faith and tradition. The early-modern Catholicism of northern Europe assumed a sharp distinction between dogma as the content of tradition and worship as its form. Emphasizing the transcendence of God, post-Tridentine Catholicism tended to downplay the sacramental presence of the divine in nature and emphasize explicit doctrinal statements and official liturgical practice. In contrast, the medieval Catholicism of Latin America understood belief to be expressed primarily through symbols and popular devotions.

The medieval tradition understood God, the cosmos, and the human person in integral relation to each other. Physical existence revealed a God who lived in its midst. Nature did not merely reflect the divine, but embodied it: As in the sacrament of the Eucharist, symbol and symbolized were seen as one. Goizueta pointed to the persistence of this organic world view in the 1996 national uprising in Mexico following the suggestion by Abbot Guillermo Schulemburg of the Basilica of Our Lady of Guadalupe in Mexico City that the story of Guadalupe is "only a symbol, not a reality." For the people of Mexico, symbol remains a manifestation of the real in our midst.

This understanding of symbol, in turn, issues in a distinct social ethic. Within Latino Catholicism, society and nature both mediate divine presence; faith is never purely personal, but always communal. The greatest threat to the life of faith lies not in suffering or death, but in solitude. Latinos understand the person of Jesus as one who walks with his people through the everyday, or *lo cotidiano*. In the ubiquitous images of the *Divino Rostro* (Holy Countenance) in Latino homes, and especially in the *Via Crucis*, Jesus accompanies his people through the pain and suffering that so often fill their daily lives. Suffering is less a problem to be solved than an occasion for communal support. For Latino Catholics, "suffering shared is already suffering in retreat." Jesus accomplishes the resurrection by the very act of accompanying the people on their crucifixion. Against the modern notion of freedom as autonomy, Goizueta argued that the Jesus of Latino popular Catholicism liberates us "precisely by refusing to leave us alone, by refusing to withdraw from any aspect of our lives."

Goizueta concluded his talk by acknowledging the deficiencies of both traditions within American Catholicism, and calling for a higher synthesis of the two. For all its virtues, medieval sacramentalism has often led to a false sanctification of oppressive social orders, and the complete absorption of the individual by the community. At the same time, modern rationalism, for all its vices, has served the gospel through its advancement of the arts and sciences and its affirmation of the creative possibilities of the human person. According to Goizueta, "each insight needs the other; it is together that they represent the richness of the Catholic tradition."

Unity across the Anglo-Latino divide is particularly urgent in the face of the two greatest threats to American Catholicism: the spread of an individualized spirituality that reduces divine truth to a matter of personal preference, and the continued expansion of a global market that wages war against all established traditions. Goizueta called for a critical engagement with this "culture of death." In the face of modern, rootless individualism, Catholicism must bear witness to an alternative understanding of human freedom rooted in an organic worldview. Essential to the internal vitality of Catholicism, this witness would also ideally serve as Catholicism's distinct contribution to American culture.
American Catholic Studies Seminar: A Pluralistic Catholicism

The American Catholic Studies Seminar on October 28, 1999, featured a discussion of "The Possibilities for a Pluralistic Catholicism," a paper presented by Michele Dillon, associate professor of sociology at Yale University. Patricia Chang, assistant professor of sociology at the University of Notre Dame, and Scott Appleby, director of the Cushwa Center, served as commentators.

Professor Dillon's presentation drew on her recent book, Catholic Identity: Balancing Reason, Faith, and Power (Cambridge University Press, 1999), which challenges the conventional understanding that the polarization of liberal and conservative elements within the church undermines the cohesiveness of Catholic communalism. Presenting a condensed empirical study, Dillon argued that the attention given to divisive doctrinal issues has obscured the everyday reality of a common sacramental and institutional inheritance that can provide the basis for dialogue between liberal and conservative Catholics. Liberals tend to identify Catholicism with issues of social justice, while conservatives tend to identify it with the teaching of the hierarchy, but empirical sociological research confirms the Catholic theologian David Tracy's insistence that Catholicism is a living, dynamic tradition open to a plurality of interpretations.

Dillon based her account of liberal or "pro-change" Catholics on survey and interview research covering three organizations: the Women's Ordination Conference (WOC); Dignity, a group working for acceptance of homosexuality within Catholicism; and Catholics for a Free Choice, an abortion rights group. She found that each group dissents from official church teaching, yet remains "strongly integrated with the Catholic tradition." Dillon stressed that these groups offer an internal critique of the church that rejects specific teachings in the name of other teachings deemed to be more basic to the essence of Catholicism. WOC members thus argue for opening the priesthood to women in the name of "a Christ-embodied ethics of justice and equality." Homosexual and pro-choice Catholics similarly argue for their causes by drawing on the church's teaching regarding the dignity of the human person.

Dillon based her account of conservative Catholicism on research among members of the Catholic League for Religious and Civil Rights. With the orthodoxy of this group not in question, Dillon interpreted her data with an eye toward points of contact that could serve as a basis for dialogue with pro-change Catholics. She found that liberals and conservatives share common memories and experiences of liturgical practices such as baptisms, weddings, funerals, and the Mass; these rituals serve both groups not only as sources of pride, but as sources of self-identity. Dillon speculated that the centrality of the Eucharist to conservative Catholics might lead them to reconsider their opposition to women's ordination as the shortage of priests approaches crisis proportions. Conservatives and liberals also seem to share a common pride in Catholic public figures such as John Kennedy, or more recently, Pope John Paul II. Dillon reported that a member of Dignity, while dissenting from the church's teaching on homosexuality, nonetheless expressed deep pride in his Catholicism following a visit by the pope to San Francisco in which he ministered to AIDS patients.

Pro-change Catholics are less alienated from the institutional church than generally perceived, Dillon argued. Liberals as well as conservatives appear genuinely attached to the church as a global institution with unique historical ties to the earliest days of Christianity. Against the Protestant tendency toward sectarian splintering, Dillon sees in Catholics a tendency to refashion their traditions from within a single, continuous institution. Ultimately, "being Catholic appears to have a communal significance that transcends the liberalism or conservatism of its adherents."

Both commentators expressed sympathy for Dillon's sanguine vision of Catholic pluralism, but registered some skepticism as to its accuracy. Professor Chang felt that Dillon underestimated the extent of the erosion of Catholic communal life in the years following Vatican II. The greater interpretive diversity in the church since Vatican II would seem to undermine the unifying power of common sacraments and symbols. Professor Appleby objected that Dillon's conclusions simply do not hold up when judged against the broader experience of division within the contemporary church. The elites Dillon examines have shown little interest in engaging in fruitful dialogue across liberal/conservative lines, despite efforts from moderates to bring them together on the basis of shared rituals, memories, sacramental worldview and other underlying sources of unity mentioned by Dillon. Appleby contended that Dillon's claims would be more convincing if supported by evidence drawn from everyday parish life, rather than from relatively unrepresentative activist groups.

Audience participants who joined in the discussion expressed strong views on both sides of the issue of pluralism. Some members spoke critically of their own experiences growing up in the pre-Vatican II church, and applauded Dillon's concern for reimagining the boundaries of Catholicism; others questioned Dillon's reticence to acknowledge the role of the magisterium in assuring and enforcing the boundaries that make Catholicism an intelligible and identifiable tradition. Professor Dillon concluded the seminar by
cautioning against those who assume the immigrant Catholicism of the pre-Vatican II era to be the only viable model of church unity. She acknowledged the limitations of her data, and conceded that a fuller understanding of Catholic pluralism awaits more detailed study of contemporary parish life. Still, she insisted that the future of that life must reflect the diversity of an increasingly educated laity less willing to accept the received teachings of the church hierarchy, and more likely to practice its faith by redefining conventional boundaries.

**Research Travel Grants**

These grants help defray the expenses of travel to Notre Dame's library and archival collections for research on American Catholicism. Recipients of awards in 2000 include:

*Joe B. Fulton* of Dalton State College, for his project on “Mark Twain and Catholicism: A Fifty-Year Dialogue.” Mark Twain's attitudes toward Catholicism as expressed in his lectures and books changed over time from bigotry to sympathy. This study will examine reviews in Catholic publications and the responses to the “changing Twain.”

*Margaret A. Hogan*, a graduate student in American history at the University of Wisconsin-Madison, for her research on “Controlling the Convent: Authority and Decision-making among Catholic Women Religious in Kentucky, 1812-1860.” This project examines authority and decision-making within three orders of Catholic women religious in 19th-century Kentucky, and the influence other church organizations—especially local dioceses and the Propaganda Fide—had on these processes.

*Antonio Medina-Rivera*, Cleveland State University, for his project entitled “The Spanish Language and the Catholic Church in the United States,” will describe and analyze, from a sociolinguistic perspective, the use and importance of the Spanish language within Catholic institutions in the United States.

*Tricia Terese Pyne*, a historian and archivist, for her project entitled, “This Land is Home to Us: Catholicism in West Virginia, 1850-2000,” a history of the Diocese of Wheeling-Charleston, West Virginia.

*Beth Barton Schweihr*, for her project entitled “Catholic Immigrants in the Old South,” a study of the place of Catholicism in the evangelical South. She will examine how living in the midst of a slave society divided along racial lines affected relationships within Catholic communities divided along ethnic and class lines.

*William B. Seconda*, a graduate student in the history department at the University of Notre Dame, for his study of “Pokagon Village: The Catholic Potawatomi of the St. Joseph River Valley.” This is part of a larger interdisciplinary project on the material culture of the Catholic Potawatomi in Niles, Michigan.

**Hibernian Research Awards**

This annual research award, funded by an endowment from the Ancient Order of Hibernians, is designed to further the scholarly study of the Irish in America. This year, *Susanna Ashton* of the Department of English at Clemson University won an award for her project entitled *John Boyle O'Reilly and the “Moundyne.”* Professor Ashton proposes to edit, introduce and prepare for reissue John Boyle O'Reilly's *Moundyne*, an important 19th-century Irish-American novel.

The deadline for applications for Hibernian Research Awards each year is December 31.

---

**Catholic Encounters in the American Century**

continued from page 1

center of piety and to traditional (“pre-modern”) Catholic practices and worldview, represent both challenge and hope to Euro-Americans perilously advanced in their internalization of the materialist and individualist values ascendant in the contemporary United States?

The refining of such questions, and many others raised during the three days of discussion, was a notable accomplishment of the conferences. Definitive answers, of course, await the greater wisdom of a skilled synthesist, many years hence, who will have assessed the findings of the several volumes and dissertations currently being prepared. But the refining of the questions is an invaluable first step.

The opening sessions of the conference, on the changing modes of participation and leadership by women religious and lay women, moved deftly in this direction. Could — did — Catholics adapt to modern American institutions and values on their own terms? Catholic separateness has few iconic markers as powerful as the figure of the veiled, robed woman religious; the exclusion of women from the priesthood has marked the Catholic Church as the most powerful bastion of patriarchy amidst the formal gender egalitarianism of American society. Still, the presentations and papers revealed Catholic women, religious and lay, fully engaged in the mainstream developments of their time, and suggested the ways in which even a distinctly Catholic traditionalism served to foster social change.

Patricia Byrne, C.S.J., examined the struggle of the Sisters of the Sacred Heart to respond to the increasing prominence of educational institutions in American life. A French teaching order committed to the highest European standards of education, the sisters succeeded at producing highly educated Catholic women who pursued professional careers — an outcome quite at odds with the sisters' stated mission of preparing young women for conventional roles as wives and mothers. Ana María Díaz-Stevens’ study of the missionary work of women religious in Puerto Rico also explored the diverse and surprising social implications of Catholic traditionalism. Sent to Puerto Rico primarily to counteract the Protestant missionary efforts that followed in the wake of U.S. acquisition of
the territory following the Spanish-American War, orders such as the Missionary Sisters of the Most Blessed Trinity worked to develop indigenous church leadership capable of resisting the force of American cultural imperialism.

Gina Marie Pitti and Claire Wolfteich further demonstrated how traditional devotions and domestic ideals empowered women to explore new social roles. Pitti argued that the Sociedad Guadalupana, a pious organization dedicated to Our Lady of Guadalupe, provided Mexican and Mexican-American Catholic women an institutional vehicle to support women’s leadership roles in the face of uncertain support from an American church dominated by Euro-American males. Wolfteich took issue with the conventional feminist equation of Catholicism with conservative ideals regarding the place of women in the work force. Skeptical of mainstream feminist notions of work as a means of self-fulfillment, Catholic women nonetheless justified work outside the home in the name of providing for the material welfare of their families.

Commenting on the papers, Victoria Brown cautioned that while women have not always engaged in activism for explicitly feminist goals, the mere entry of women into the public sphere has often been interpreted by men as a threat to patriarchy. Studies of Catholic women must be alert to the external constraints of male authority, she urged, as well as the self-imposed limitations of traditional notions of female self-sacrifice.

The members of the Catholic Women working group also offered accounts of more straightforward engagements with progressive social developments. Commentator Carol Coburn noted how the papers show the central role of Catholic women, particularly women religious, as “cultural brokers” mediating between Catholics and non-Catholics, and among diverse racial and ethnic groups within the church. In their presentations Laura Murphy and Amy L. Koehlinger focused on Catholic women forging social bonds outside of the church. Murphy’s research on Catholic labor activism during the Progressive Era examined Catholic laywomen who, in legitimizing the role of women as wage earners, drew equally on communal Catholic traditions of social justice and the more individualistic doctrines of the Protestant reform tradition. Despite their varying degrees of suspicion of middle-class reformers, female Catholic activists came to see some form of dialogue and coalition with them as the most fruitful strategy for success in attaining the vote and the minimum wage. This intercultural dialogue would take on a deeper personal significance later in the century.

According to Koehlinger, women religious who engaged in apostolic works among African Americans in the South during the 1960s measured their success in terms of a reciprocal experience of growth between white “teachers” and African-American “students.” Alienated from the middle-class white culture of the North and the Protestant segregated culture of the South, the sisters saw in this double alienation a basis for solidarity with the socially marginalized non-Catholic African-American students they served in the South.

Deborah Skok and Darra Mulderry explored a different dimension of interaction, raising and refining provocative questions along the way. To what degree and in which circumstances did the Catholic encounter with American social reform movements provide an opportunity for personal growth and even conversion, including the development of a genuinely critical attitude toward the church itself? Skok’s description of Catholic settlement house workers in Chicago examined the careers of Mary Amberg and Marie Plamondon, laywomen who used their reform work to find personal autonomy and self-fulfillment in a Catholic subculture that accorded little status to single laywomen. Viewed with suspicion by the clergy, Amberg and Plamondon nonetheless did the church’s work in reinforcing traditional sexual restraint in the community, particularly for young immigrant girls; at the same time, they provided young girls with “safe” social activities outside the home that loosened the ties of immigrant social norms and allowed girls greater space to develop as individuals.

Mulderry showed how the growing concern for women’s personal development was reinforced by the Sister Formation Movement of the 1950s. Responding to Pope Pius XII’s 1952 call for women religious to distinguish the “essential” from the “obsolete” in their traditions, the movement promoted advanced academic instruction for sisters, as well as greater space for critical thinking, dialogic approaches to problem-solving, and engagement with developments in psychology and the social sciences. A decade prior to Vatican II, the Sister Formation Movement anticipated and confronted tensions between traditional ideals of humble obedience and newer egalitarian notions drawn from feminism.

Victoria Brown saw the tension between communal obligations and individual desires for self-fulfillment as a common thread throughout the presentations and papers. Insisting that scholars address the more specific question “Communalism toward what end?” Brown stressed the need for greater precision in the assessment of the repressive and emancipatory potential of community life.

The phenomenon of “traditional” Catholic women praying the rosary for “untraditional” jobs outside the home exemplifies the way in which official rituals and popular devotions have provided a means for reconciling conflicting tendencies within the church. The panel on “Euro-American Popular
Catholicism” showed the religious practices internal to church life to be nonetheless subject to the same broad historical forces altering Catholic understandings of the proper role of women in church and society. How, then, were changes in piety both an expression of social change in the lives of Catholics and a means of shaping Catholic responses to change?

In analyzing Catholic prayer from 1926 to 1976, Joseph Chinnici, O.F.M., forcefully challenged the conventional notion of a sharp historical divide between pre- and post-Vatican II Catholicism. The decades preceding the council prepared the way for the general acceptance of liturgical change through a variety of reform movements within the church, all bound together by a general “pedagogy of participation.” The dialogue Mass, the introduction of missals, and a greater emphasis on the reading of scripture reflected a broader effort to infuse Catholic religious practice with a greater commitment to active involvement. Prior to Vatican II, reformers cast this personalizing reorientation within a broader, hierarchical understanding of the church as the Mystical Body of Christ. The council’s understanding of the church as the People of God recast this spirituality in the context of social egalitarianism. As they participated in the social movements of the 1960s, Catholics developed a new understanding of participation that threatened the institutional stability of the church itself.

In her presentation on Marian devotions Paula Kane also traced the relationship between developments in the broader American cultural and social environment and changes in Catholic devotional practices. Devotion to Our Lady of Fatima revitalized Marian piety in the late 1940s. Fatima provided the basis for a Catholic identity capable of uniting diverse ethnic groups thrown together in the new postwar suburbs; at the same time, the strident anticommunism of the devotion eased the assimilation of Catholics into mainstream American culture. By the mid-1950s, as suburbanization continued to dilute devotionalism and post-McCarthy anticommunism entered its “liberal” phase, devotion to Our Lady of Fatima lost much of its original animating purpose. Vatican II accelerated the decline of traditional Marian piety, stressing the biblical and liturgical Mary over the older devotional Mary of novenas and the rosary. Commentator Thomas Kselman saw in these changes a Protestantizing tendency as well, further evidence of the growing convergence between Catholic Americans and the broader American religious environment.

James O’Toole presented the strongest case for pre- and post-conciliar discontinuity in his remarks on the practice of confession. In the 1950s it was not unusual for a priest to hear close to 200 confessions per week; by the 1980s, O’Toole reported, less than 1 percent of Catholics participated in weekly confession. O’Toole attributed this decline in part to the popularity of developments in modern psychology that made the sacramental formulas of confession appear shallow and mechanistic. Within Catholic sacramental and moral life itself, the opening of communion to all but those in a state of mortal sin severed the link between confession and the reception of the Eucharist, and thus further undermined the practice. These are but two possible explanations for the change in Catholic attitudes toward and practice of confession; accounting for the sudden and intense nature of that change is the burden of O’Toole’s larger study.

Margaret McGuinness’ presentation on Eucharistic devotions offered some observations relevant to O’Toole’s quest for explanations. McGuinness reflected on an earlier era in which devotions such as Forty Hours and Nocturnal Adoration were opportunities for the laity to encounter the Eucharist short of actual reception. As the meaning of “Eucharist” was affected by the intertwining of the liturgy and the social doctrine of the church, such opportunities changed and multiplied. The journey from the 1926 Eucharistic Congress (on “The Eucharist and Christian Life”) to the 1976 congress (“The Eucharist and the Hungers of the Human Family”) suggests the move outward from piety to social justice. McGuinness argued that this transformation had its roots in a preconciliar movement away from adoration toward frequent reception.

Commentator Paul Ginnett followed Kselman and O’Toole in linking these changes to the increasing influence of humanistic psychology on Catholic theologians. Drawing on this psychology, Ginnett suggested that Catholic sacraments, particularly the Eucharist, might be seen as “transitional objects” in that they help to concretize an incomprehensible reality not fully available to the believer; the decline in these devotions, he opined, suggests the general move of Catholics away from external sacramental objects to a more internalized spirituality. Taking a different approach, the historical theologian Marie Anne Mayeski linked the decline in devotions to a decline in the ethnic subcultures that sustained them. The very category “Euro-American,” she said, reflects an abstraction of ethnic particularity rooted in the general assimilation of Catholics of European descent into the norms of middle-class American Protestantism. Mayeski praised the papers for their internal, descriptive history of this process, but called for greater attention to the larger social and economic factors influencing the changes in devotional practice.

Leslie Tenter’s presentation on the controversy over artificial birth control spoke directly to Mayeski’s concern for exploring the interaction of devotionalism and American culture. Official church opposition to birth control had a profound effect on the practice of confession. The teaching on birth control developed in the pastoral context of confession, particularly as the sacrament was incorporated into the parish missions conducted by visiting priests from the religious orders. With knowledge of and access to artificial contraception still somewhat limited, the topic proved a matter of mutual embarrassment for priest and penitent rather than the occasion for lay revolt that it would become in the wake of
Catholic Encounters in the American Century

Humanae Vitae. Still, Tendler argued for the roots of this revolt in the lay-clerical tensions of the early 20th century. Ironically, even as acceptance by Catholics of secular thinking on birth control undermined the practice of confession, formal opposition to artificial birth control on the part of the hierarchy stands as a distinctive marker of Catholic identity in 20th-century America.

Attention to the dynamic interaction between the church and American society placed the issues surrounding the Second Vatican Council in a striking variety of new contexts. Still, these issues remain largely irrelevant to the fastest-growing segment of the church, Latina/o Catholics. Introducing the panel on “Latina/o Popular Catholicism,” Gary Riebe-Estrella, S.V.D., named the challenge facing Latino Catholic studies as the articulation of the distinct world view underlying popular Latino religious practices. This task begins with the recognition that chronology, themes, assumptions and methods of inquiry change when the focus shifts from Euro-American to Latino Catholics.

Adding a necessary complicating voice to the story of American Catholicism, the panel on Latina/o Catholicism provided the most interdisciplinary session of the conference. Panelists approached their subject from the perspectives of sociology, ethnography and theology as well as history, with slide presentations adding an important visual component to each talk. Timothy Matovina spoke on Guadalupe devotion in San Antonio during the period of the Mexican Revolution. As the persecution of the church by the revolutionary government inspired a Catholic revival among Latinos of San Antonio, devotion to Our Lady of Guadalupe provided a vehicle for the expression of Mexican ethnic solidarity in the face of Anglo racism in Texas.

In her ethnography of the Via Crucis in the Pilsen neighborhood of Chicago, KarenMary Davalos similarly argued that the rituals of popular Catholicism empower Latinos to reclaim public space both from the external threats of white racism and the internal threats of gang violence. Lara Medina and Gilbert Cadena’s presentation of their work on the Dia de los Muertos in Los Angeles continued to develop these themes by calling attention to the pre-Catholic roots of the view of death and resurrection dramatized in the Via Crucis. Turning to the everyday world of sickness and health, Luis Leon explored the ambiguous relationship between Catholicism and the Mexican folk healing tradition of curanderismo.

Theological reflections by Roberto Goizueta and Orlando Espin framed the presentation of these four case studies. Goizueta emphasized the need to see these practices in terms of a deeper underlying approach to reality that refuses the dichotomizing scheme of modern western thought. The ritual and drama of these practices call into question mainstream dualisms such as public/private, individual/community, material/spiritual, and, most strikingly, life/death. Life and death need be opposed only if seen in terms of individual existence. The communal orientation of Latino popular Catholicism transforms death into life through communal participation: the act of accompanying Jesus on the Via Crucis brings Easter resurrection into the Good Friday crucifixion itself.

Orlando Espin concluded the panel presentations by reflecting on these practices as instances of the sensus fidelium at work in the development and elaboration of doctrine within the Catholic tradition. The practices examined by Matovina, Davalos, and Medina and Cadena embody distinctly popular contributions to Catholic traditions affirming human dignity, social justice and the communio sanctorum. Leon’s study, by contrast, suggests powerful resonances between these theological traditions and the practice of curanderismo, but the practice remains more folk than Catholic, an instance of nepantla — the survival of a pre-Catholic practice — rather than a contribution to Catholic doctrine.

Commentators Milagros Peña and Robert Schreiter, C.P.P.S., praised the panelists for their sensitivity to the indigenous Mexican roots of the ostensibly Catholic practices examined. Peña suggested, nonetheless, that the particularity of the indigenous Nahua/Tlaxcalan religions must be apprehended on its own terms, not simply as refected through Catholic practice. Alternately, scholars must attend to the relationship between Latino popular Catholicism and the institutional church: How have popular rituals challenged the Catholic Church itself, and how have changes in the church, notably Vatican II, affected Latino popular Catholicism?

Schreiter also noted that despite certain irreducible particularities, the Latino experience of exile and immigration resonates with that of many other groups in American society. As Latino popular rituals shape the public space of the American cities that continue to draw immigrants from around the world, Latinos help to shape American culture as a whole. Still, a true appreciation of this contribution requires attention to distinctive features of Latino religion. Schreiter evoked the concepts of tiempos mixtos and nepantla to stress the ways in which Latino practices allow for the simultaneous presence of premodernity, modernity, and postmodernity, and turn our understanding of the world away from binary oppositions toward shifting modalities.

The Public Presence working group returned to the more conventional territory of Euro-American Catholicism, but complicated the story of the American reception of Vatican II by focusing on class and race. The first panel, “Labor and Social Activism,” went far in revising the conventional equation of Catholicism with labor conservatism. Mary
Wingerd, drawing on her study of ethno-religious politics in St. Paul, Minnesota, traced the relative lack of labor strife in heavily Catholic St. Paul, as compared to Protestant Minneapolis, to the church's role as a mediator among competing social, economic, and political interest groups at the local level of parish and city. No simple force for conservativism, the church spoke out in favor of social justice for labor even as it defended the property rights of capital.

Steve Rosswurm's paper on Catholics and the CIO further nuanced the received wisdom on Catholic conservatism. With the church's turn to official public support for unionism in 1935, the Social Action Department of the National Catholic Welfare Conference established programs to educate the clergy in the social encyclicals *Rerum Novarum* and *Quadragesimo Anno*.

Staunchly anticommunist, these "labor priests" nonetheless played a key role in supporting CIO organizing drives and strikes from 1937 to 1942, and also took their pro-CIO message to middle-class Catholics who might otherwise be suspicious of unionism. Commentator Bruce Nelson praised the papers for introducing the Catholic dimension into labor history, but urged that greater attention be given to how the workers themselves understood the church's social teaching.

With support from the church and recognition by the state, unions helped to usher Catholics into the middle class. Even as Catholics embraced economic assimilation, they struggled to maintain a distinct cultural difference. James Fisher's presentation on the Jesuit labor priest, Father John Corridan, stressed Corridan's efforts to create a persona capable of reconciling the cultural claims of the tribal, violent waterfront tradition of the International Longshoreman's Association with the more abstract principles of social justice expounded in the papal encyclicals. Committed to reform, Corridan nonetheless rejected simple WASP moralism in favor of a new model of manly fortitude that drew on the violent traditions of the waterfront itself. Colleen Doody's analysis of the Catholic community in Detroit similarly stressed cultural distinctiveness. Catholics saw communism as a symptom of a deeper cultural crisis manifested in rising secular modernism and an idolatrous faith in scientific expertise within America itself. Distinctly Catholic expressions of anticommmunist sentiment, such as the block rosary and devotion to Our Lady of Fatima, reflect an understanding of Catholicism as a distinct repository of spiritual values capable of saving America from its materialism.

Commentator Nick Salvatore pointed to the role played by suburbanization. Corridan's manly posturing, for example, might have reflected the need for the reinvigoration of a newly middle class Catholic Church as much as any residual commitment to the older ethos of the waterfront. Similarly, the suburban context of the block rosaries examined by Doody suggests the need to shore up the private world of church and family as much as the desire to transform the public world through opposition to modernity. This private world faced challenges not only from the abstract forces of modernity, but from the concrete, local threat of black families moving into white neighborhoods. Echoing Nelson's comments on Catholic resistance to blacks in unions, Salvatore called for greater attention to the role of race in the development of working class Catholic identity.

Race did indeed replace class at the center of the American reform agenda in the second half of the century. With a relatively small African-American constituency, the church failed to develop a tradition of teaching on race to compare with the social encyclicals on labor, and the issue of race called Catholics out of their communal subculture even more dramatically than labor activism. The panel on "Place and Public Presence" addressed this transition in a variety of local settings.

In his presentation on Catholics in Pittsburgh, Timothy Kelly confirmed Nelson's and Salvatore's suspicions concerning the instability of the subculture in the face of upward mobility: a Eucharistic Rally held at Forbes Field drew 100,000 laymen in 1950, while a similar rally drew only 30,000 in 1955. By the early 1960s, the laity had already moved away from the deferential, hierarchical orientation of traditional Catholicism, and was ready to embrace the more egalitarian model of church advanced by Vatican II. Kristine LaLonde's presentation on Catholics in Washington, D.C., however, cautioned against any simple equation of theological and social liberalism. Archbishop Patrick O'Boyle served as the Catholic public presence in the civil rights movement in Washington, yet imposed his racial justice agenda on his diocese against the wishes of the laity. In turn, Catholic involvement in the struggle for racial equality ultimately led many Washington Catholics to question O'Boyle's authoritarian leadership, and the whole structure of pre-Vatican II parish life.

Commentator John McGreevy accepted the soundness of these descriptive accounts of the breakup of the parish institutions that had sustained Catholic identity through the first half of the century, but found this story still in need of a more precise chain of causation, particularly on the specific connections between what is generally understood to be the ethos of Vatican II and the broader revulsion against authority and rules in American society.

Presentations by Andrew Moore and Mark Santow further explored how the particularities of place shaped popular response to the church's official teaching on race. Speaking on Alabama civil rights activist Albert S. Foley, S.J., Moore argued that the southern laity proved themselves more southern than Catholic in their response to the church's endorsement of desegregation. The church's official stand ensured that Catholics would continue to be viewed with suspicion as outsiders by southern Protestants. Lacking the cohesive parish structures of northern Catholicism, white southern Catholics took race as the defining marker of their social identity.

Sartow's presentation on the community-organizing efforts of Saul Alinsky demonstrated that these parish structures profoundly shaped the strategies for residential integration in Chicago. A secular-Jewish radical, Alinsky balanced his commitment to racial integration with a respect for the integrity of the Catholic parish life clearly threatened by such a commitment. Proposing a benign quota system to restrict the number of blacks allowed to move into white parish neighborhoods, Alinsky alienated both Catholics who feared a slippery slope to black takeover, and white liberals who saw the use of quotas as a capitulation to Catholic racism.
Ironically, the church’s progressivism on matters of race undermined its authority with the laity as much as its conservatism on sexual matters such as birth control. This irony points to one important way in which Catholic particulars complicate the broader American story of the revolt against established authority. Commentator Peter Steinfels concluded the session by reinforcing the call for greater specificity in local accounts of this story. He cautioned that the broader theological changes remain somewhat loosely tied to action on the ground. How does the story line change, he asked, when the historical actors are more fully considered as individuals rather than as advocates of certain political or intellectual positions?

At the close of the conference, David O’Brien and Margaret O’Brien Steinfels assessed the significance of the papers and presentations within the existing body of scholarship on Catholic America. According to O’Brien, the conference defined three broad issues facing historians. First and foremost is the problem of the relationship between the parts and the whole. The Cushwa Center project is striving to integrate Catholic history into mainstream American history at a time when most historians have abandoned the effort to tell a single American story. The diversity of presentations suggests inherent difficulties in presenting any single, unified account of American Catholicism, much less of American history; as evidenced most forcefully in the panel on Latino popular Catholicism, American Catholics appear divided not simply by practices and beliefs, but by world view.

The second challenge identified by O’Brien is the disjunction between the story of the Catholic subculture and that of Catholic assimilation into the mainstream culture. The distinctive practices that sustained the subculture did not serve Catholics well outside of it; moreover, the subculture provided only limited resources for those who wished to reform it from within. Ironically, labor priests and activist sisters, among others, ultimately had to escape the subculture to find God. How does one name, much less make sense of, the complex and mercurial relationship between “church” and “world”?

Finally, O’Brien noted the problem of aspiration — how new aspirations undermine the memories that sustain distinctive cultural practices. There may be no returning to the lost world of tribal Catholicism, but middle class achievement has brought a certain discontent that can be met only with a rebirth of aspiration. The transformation of victimhood into agency enacted in the public rituals of Latino Catholicism suggests one such rebirth.

Peggy Steinfels praised the researchers for re-orienting the focus and expanding the scope of what constitutes Catholic history. Sisters built the American church, and the opening panel made clear that no adequate Catholic history can be written that does not proceed from a recognition of the centrality of sisters to the life of the church. In expanding our understanding of this history, Steinfels continued, the conference scholars effectively drew on a variety of untapped resources, from Steve Rosswurm’s use of material on anticomunism recently made available through the Freedom of Information Act, to Paula Kane’s use of popular literature such as Our Lady’s Digest.

The papers as a whole challenge the conventional understanding of Vatican II as a historical rupture; Leslie Tendler’s paper on contraception, in particular, reminds us that in history, there are few real revolutions. Taken as a whole, the papers demonstrate how far Catholic historians have come from the hagiographies and apologetics of past scholarship; however, this distance raises serious questions about the degree to which this new Catholic history can genuinely be the work of a community. The challenge facing Catholic historians, Steinfels concluded, lies in respecting the integrity of sources while maintaining the essential tension between critical distance and sympathetic imagination.

---

**James W. Malone, 1920–2000**

On Sunday, April 9, James W. Malone, the retired bishop of Youngstown, Ohio, succumbed to cancer. He was 80 years old.

Born and raised in Youngstown, Malone was ordained a priest in 1945. He served as associate pastor of St. Columba parish in Youngstown from 1945 to 1950, and superintendent of diocesan schools from 1952 to 1965, receiving his doctorate from the Catholic University of America in 1957. Ordained as an auxiliary bishop in 1960, Malone was named bishop of the Diocese of Youngstown in 1968. From 1983 to 1986, Bishop Malone served as president of the National Conference of Catholic Bishops (NCCB) — the first prelate below the rank of cardinal to hold the position. After 27 years of service, he retired from his position as bishop of Youngstown in 1995.

Throughout his tenure as bishop, Bishop Malone refused to consign the church’s moral teachings to the private sphere. Faced with a deteriorating local industrial economy in the late 1970s, he led interdenominational social action groups that were fighting plant closings and working for employee ownership of steel mills. As head of the NCCB, he worked to renew support for the reforms of Vatican II, and issued a pastoral letter that reinforced and specified elements of the church’s commitment to work on behalf of the poor.

Bishop Malone worked tirelessly to promote ecumenical relations and social justice. A kind and generous man, he was a superb pastor, loved and admired by the people of his diocese and by many in the church beyond Youngstown. A close friend of the Cushwa family and an enthusiastic supporter of the Cushwa Center, Bishop Malone fulfilled his promise to attend the March conference on Catholicism in Twentieth-Century America, despite his failing health. He will be missed by all who had the honor of knowing him. Requiescat in pace.
The John Nicholas Brown Center for the Study of American Civilization is now accepting applications for its Research Fellowship Program. The center supports scholarship across a broad range of fields, including history, the history of art and architecture, literature, religion, material culture, music, historic preservation, and urban planning. Preference is given to scholars working with Rhode Island materials or requiring access to New England resources. Fellowships are open to advanced graduate students, junior or senior faculty, independent scholars, and humanities professionals. The center provides office space in the historic Nightingale-Brown House, access to Brown University resources, and a stipend of up to $2,000 for a term of residence between one and six months during one of two award cycles each year: January through June, and July through December. Application deadlines are: November 1 for residence between January and June; and April 15 for residence between July and December. To apply, send a credentials package consisting of a one- to two-page project abstract, a one- to two-page curriculum vitae, a one-page work plan, a proposed budget (living expenses may be included), and one letter of recommendation. Send inquiries or mail application materials to: Joyce M. Botelho, Director; The John Nicholas Brown Center; Brown University, Providence, RI 02912. Phone: (401) 272-0357. Fax: (401) 272-1930. E-mail: Joyce_Botelho@Brown.edu.

The Louisville Institute is accepting applications for Study Grants for Pastoral Leaders. The institute invites pastors to identify an area of concern to explore, and design a method of inquiry with the following purposes in view: 1) to deepen one’s understanding of what it means to be a pastor in a changing church in a changing culture; 2) to provide a sabbath — time for the renewal of a pastor’s vocation; and 3) to prepare for a renewed engagement with one’s particular context of ministry. The Louisville Institute will award grants of $4,000 (four weeks), $8,000 (eight weeks) and $12,000 (12 weeks). Up to 40 grants will be awarded in this year’s program. The program is open to Protestant ministers and Roman Catholic parish priests, church staff members and denominational or diocesan staff. Applicants should be employed full-time in recognized positions of pastoral leadership within their respective Christian communities. They may be ordained or lay leaders. Retired pastoral leaders are not eligible. Seminary administrators or faculty are not eligible for this grant program. For an application form, contact Rev. David J. Wood, Associate Director; Louisville Institute; 1044 Alta Vista Road; Louisville, KY 40205-1798. Phone: (502) 895-3411, ext. 251. Fax: (502) 894-2286. E-mail: info@louisville-institute.org. Application deadline: September 15, 2000.

The Leadership Team of the Sisters of Saint Francis, Rochester Minnesota, is seeking an ABD doctoral student to write the history of the College of Saint Teresa, Winona, Minnesota. The proposed history would document all aspects of the institution from its origins in the Winona Seminary for Young Ladies, which opened in 1894, to the closing of the college in 1989; special attention would be given to the role of the Franciscan sisters throughout this period. Rochester Franciscans believe that this history would be an appropriate study to be pursued as a dissertation. Archival materials stored at Assisi Heights in Rochester will be opened to the researcher, and archivists will provide direction and assistance. A small stipend covering room, board, and limited travel will be available to the qualified doctoral candidate chosen for this project. For information, contact Sister M. Lorann Reilly, Archivist; Assisi Heights; 1001 14th St. NW; Rochester, MN 55901. Phone: (507) 282-7441, x222.

Archives

The Archives of the Archdiocese of San Francisco has acquired the personal library of the noted Catholic philanthropist and layman, Dr. C. Albert Shumate. Dr. Shumate was an avid book collector, amassing one of the most important collections relating to California and the West. The collection will be deposited with the St. Patrick’s Seminary Library in order to facilitate access by researchers.

The New Orleans Mercy Archives have been transferred to the Regional Archives in Mercy Center; 2039 N. Geyer Road; St. Louis, MO 63131. Much of the Mercy international book collection from the Mercy Research Center in New Orleans has already been transferred to the Avila College Special Collection on Religious Women.

Conferences

The Archivists for Congregations of Women Religious will hold its annual conference September 28-October 1, 2000, in Cleveland, Ohio. Information is available from ACWR; Trinity College; 125 Michigan Ave., NE; Washington, DC 20017. E-mail: ACWR@juno.com. Web page: www.homestead.com/acwr.

The National Association for Women in Catholic Higher Education will hold a conference on the theme of “Women and Women’s Studies in the New Millennium: Forging New Models for Leadership and Social Change in Catholic Higher Education,” at Boston College, June 30-July 1, 2000. For more information, contact NAWHE office at Women’s Studies Program; Department of Sociology; McGuinn 519A; Boston College; Chestnut Hill, MA 02467. E-mail: nawhe@bc.edu.

The History of Women Religious Conference will hold its fifth triennial conference titled “Individuals in Community: Women Religious and Change — Past, Present, Future,” at Marquette University, June 17-20, 2001. This conference aims to explore the history of Women Religious by addressing questions, themes or issues.
that have shaped, and/or continue to influence, the historical evolution of religious congregations. Sessions will address topics such as encouraging vocations, education, foundation, community governance, changing ministries, ethnic or linguistic tensions, demographic composition, relations with clergy and hierarchy, spiritual tradition, or emerging models of religious life. Proposals for papers in the form of a one-page c.v. are requested by August 1, 2000. Panel proposals are encouraged but individual proposals are also acceptable. The language of the conference is English but proposals may be submitted in French. For information please contact: Elizabeth McGahan; University of New Brunswick; Department of History and Politics; P.O. Box 5050; Saint John, N.B.; Canada, E2L 4L5. E-mail: emcgahan@nbnet.nb.ca.

Call for Papers

- The Journal of Communication and Religion (JCR) encourages submission of manuscripts examining the 1999 decision of the National Conference of Catholic Bishops to apply the terms of Ex Corde Ecclesiae to the Catholic colleges and universities in the United States. The issue, planned for late 2000, will feature articles selected via JCR’s usual editorial procedure for blind-review. They should focus on JCR’s interests in communication and religion with special relation to Ex Corde Ecclesiae. The deadline is August 1, 2000. Completed manuscripts should be submitted to Edward Lee Lamoureux, Editor; JCR; Department of Communication and Multimedia Program; Bradley University; Peoria, IL 61625. Fax: (309) 677-3446. E-mail: ell@bradley.edu. Website: http://hilltop.bradley.edu/~ell.

Recent Research

- Clay O’Dell, a Ph.D. student from the University of Virginia, seeks to contact former members of the Catholic Interracial Council. Those wishing to participate in his project may reach him by phone at (415) 544-9801, or by e-mail at <cmo3@yahoo.com>.

- Fred Simonelli, author of American Fascists: George Lincoln Rockwell and the American Nazi Party (Illinois, 1999), seeks information on individual Catholic women religious or U.S. orders that sought to assist persecuted European Jews from 1933 to 1945. This “assistance” includes appeals to the U.S. government or to Vatican authorities on behalf of Nazi victims, or direct action of any kind. Contact: Fred Simonelli, Mount St. Mary’s College; 12001 Chalon Rd.; Los Angeles, CA 90049. E-mail: fjsla@earthlink.net.

Publications

The Abduction of Catholic History

Participants in the March conference on “Catholicism and Twentieth-Century America” came away with a sense of hope for a rapprochement between American history and American Catholic history. Linda Gordon’s widely acclaimed book, The Great Arizona Orphan Abduction (Harvard University Press, 1999), suggests the rich resources that exist for exploring the Catholic contribution to the dialogue of race and religion in American history. Gordon tells the story of three Catholic nuns of the Sisters of Charity who traveled from New York City to Arizona in 1904 to place 40 orphans, mostly Irish, in the adoptive homes of Mexican-Catholic families. Upon arrival, the sisters were greeted by an angry, gun-toting mob that kidnapped several of the orphans in order to place them with “proper” Anglo families. The townspeople’s insistence on maintaining racial boundaries overruled the sisters’ desire to preserve religious boundaries.

The ensuing legal battle, which extended to the U.S. Supreme Court, failed to restore custody of the 16 abducted children to the sisters.

Gordon reads the court decision as a moment of triumph for an emerging ideology of “whiteness,” and the orphan abduction story provides a window on broader developments shaping religious and racial identity in the United States. The great strength of Gordon’s book lies in its innovative narrative structure. Gordon alternates vignettes of dramatic turning points in the orphan
story with chapters that illuminate its broader social history. For example, she follows her description of the departure of the children from New York with a history of the "child swinging" movement in 19th-century urban reform. Similarly, Gordon interweaves scenes at Clifton-Morenci in Arizona with accounts of the rise of the mining frontier, the arrival of Mexicans at the mines, the domestic ideology of the Anglo women, and the distinct character of Mexican popular Catholicism.

The social history chapters suggest the ways in which the Catholic identity of the story's main characters made a difference to their behaviors and attitudes. The Sisters of Charity in New York, for example, appear as protofeminist and Catholic. Gordon describes Sister Anna Michella Bowen, the assistant secretary of the Foundling who traveled with the children to Arizona, as a woman who "dickered and parried confidently with bishops and lay charity officials" in the course of her efforts toward "maintaining the Foundling's autonomy as a female Catholic institution." Yet Gordon also sees the Foundling Hospital as embodying a set of "distinctly Catholic female ideas." Unlike their counterparts among Protestant women reformers, the sisters "enacted and symbolized a gender system that did not place women's highest aspirations into the frame of marriage, motherhood, and family." Similarly, sisters did not feel that children had to be raised in families in order to grow up properly; an institution such as the Foundling could provide sufficient nurture and support. Sisters were less likely to characterize unwed mothers as "fallen," placed less emphasis on work discipline as a key to spiritual transformation, and were more suspicious of the claims of social Darwinism than their Protestant counterparts.

Gordon also acknowledges that, as women religious, the sisters' ultimate concern lay with the salvation of souls, conceived very specifically as the transmission of the Catholic faith to the poor. She argues that the "absolutism and authoritarianism" of the sisters — by which she means their "submission to the authority of their church" — encouraged them to see even the poorest of the poor as capable of being good Catholics.

Gordon provides a provocative account of the relationship between Catholic understandings of race, on the one hand, and the binary oppositions that developed within the mainstream of Anglo-Protestant racial thinking, on the other. She renders this difference most sharply in her treatment of the Mexican idea of racial mixing, or mestizaje, which she contrasts favorably with the pejorative, Anglo notion of "half-breed." Against the Anglo conception of "white" as a "totalizing divider, a mark of all-around superiority" within a formally egalitarian social structure, the Mexican conception of "light" reflected "a shade of complexion, a calibrated measure of status" within a social system that allowed for greater racial mixing precisely because of its acceptance of the inevitability of hierarchical distinctions.

Yet Gordon never seriously ventures beyond an ethno-cultural explanation of Mexican mestizaje. Racial attitudes identified explicitly as Catholic come in for greater criticism. Gordon acknowledges that Father Constant Mandin, the French priest in charge of Sacred Heart Church at Clifton-Morenci, was hesitant to adopt the negative Anglo characterizations of Mexicans as a group; he truly appreciated "Mexican piety and the fact that the Catholic spirit and mysteries infused many of them." Although the priest was "unsullied by Anglo racism," Gordon claims that "he had his own Gallic Roman Catholic version of Orientalism" which informed his sense of cultural superiority. Similarly, Henri Granjon, Mandin's bishop, approached the orphan controversy through a "Catholic racialism" based on culture rather than ancestry or innate capacities.

In short, despite its differences from Anglo racism, Catholicism ultimately fails Gordon's recurring litmus test of "contemporary, antiracist consciousness." Granjon's inability to understand the racial dynamics of American society and his insistence on the primacy of the religious dimension of the orphan case mark Catholicism, in Gordon's account, as irredeemably complicit in the triumph of whiteness.

This racial determinism is most troubling with respect to the sisters who accompanied the orphans. Gordon acknowledges that the racial system of late-19th century New York City cannot be reduced to the simple binary of black and white. African-Americans were viewed as a distinct group, but there was no "white" race, only various races such as Irish, Italians, Poles, Jews, etc. Race could not, moreover, be separated from religion. Protestant "child savers" such as Charles Loring Brace saw conversion to Protestantism as a necessary requirement of racial uplift. Gordon admits that this religious divide was of supreme significance to the (predominantly Irish) Catholic leadership of New York, and even goes so far as to concede that the conversion goals of Protestant reformers appeared as nothing short of "genocidal" to many Catholics. As with the male hierarchy, "religion remained the overriding issue" for the sisters.

Still, just as the journey from ethnically diverse New York to racially divided Arizona transformed Irish Catholic orphans into white people, so, according to Gordon, it transformed ethnically diverse Catholic sisters into racists. Upon arrival at Clifton, the sisters saw the parents as Catholic, not Mexican; however, "they would come to 'see' that white Catholics were better than brown Catholics as they learned the Anglo racial system." For Gordon, it is "stunning how quickly they accepted this system." Her charge that the sisters "instantly, instinctively" abandoned the Mexican-Catholic for the Anglo-Protestant racial system assumes that the sisters' own persistent emphasis on the religious question was disingenuous at best. For all her interpretive subtlety, Gordon concludes bluntly that the "discourse was about race" and "religion just wasn't the issue."

In this part of Gordon's analysis, half-truth distorts the place of the
orphan incident in the larger development of the discourse of whiteness. For the Anglos of Arizona, race clearly was the issue. Bishop Granjon, who arranged the financing for the sisters’ legal efforts to retrieve the children, wished neither to challenge the Anglo racial consensus nor to turn the trial into a referendum on Catholicism; given the relative significance of race and Catholicism within the Arizona legal system, it should come as little surprise that Granjon’s legal team focused on the technical procedural issues at stake in the abduction. Just as clearly, however, Granjon’s “awareness of the Protestant drive” to capture the West motivated “his indignant and determined intervention when the foundlings were kidnapped.”

Regardless of the practical legal strategies the church’s lawyers used to regain custody of the children for the sisters, Granjon saw the incident as “a test case . . . where most [sic] elemental and vital rights of the church are involved.” The initial church investigation by the Knights of Columbus identified anti-Catholicism as a key factor in the abduction, and most of the eastern press coverage focused on the issue of anti-Catholicism. Gordon dismisses this evidence as mere propaganda, what she calls the “Foundling’s attempt to spin the conflict in exclusively religious terms.”

The reduction of Catholicism to “spin” is perhaps nowhere more apparent than in Gordon’s interpretation of the Mexican response to the trial. Gordon takes the lack of sources on the particular families involved in the adoptions as license to generalize from other sources. As regular churchgoers, the Mexican women seeking to adopt the children were not, however, especially representative. The one woman for whom the most sources exist, Margarita Chacón, was both religiously and ethnically idiosyncratic. Her self an orphan of unclear, but definitely not Mexican ethnic descent (German and either French or Spanish), Chacón was an extremely devout woman who had achieved the status of something close to sainthood in her local community; even the racist Anglos hesitated to take her orphan away from her. The one Mexi-

can with the opportunity to speak in court (she was subpoenaed), she declined on the grounds that poor health prevented her from making the trip to the Supreme Court trial in Washington.

A scolding of the church’s lawyers for the insensitivity of attempting to get Margarita to testify (it surely would have put her in danger back in Arizona), Gordon speculates on the real reasons she “must have” had for refusing the subpoena: her sense of the Catholic Church’s capitulation to racism. With no documentation as to Margarita’s actual thoughts, Gordon concludes: “Mrs. Chacón was entirely correct about the trial.” That Mexican-Americans would be suspicious of Anglo justice seems a fairly safe historical assumption; however, Gordon’s repeated speculations on what non-existent sources might reveal represent an unfortunate blurring of fact and assumption. Against her own caution “to resist . . . presentism, to break free of the sticky web of today’s categories,” Gordon reads the Arizona orphan abduction through the narrowly presentist lens of “contemporary, antiracist consciousness.” In so doing she marginalizes the strong religious elements present in her sources.

Despite its failure to address adequately the religious dimension of the case, Gordon’s book nonetheless charts fruitful territory for the intersection of Catholic history and American history, particularly in the area of race. That the sisters capitulated to the racist Anglo discourse of the trial is a less interesting historical issue than the fact that they originally had agreed to the adoption of Irish children by Mexican families, even after a scouting visit by their placement agent, an Irishman named G. Whitney Swayne. Similarly, Gordon’s moral condemnation of Swayne’s eventual abandonment of the sisters and the orphans in order to save his own life leaves unexamined the question of why a (presumably racist) New York Irishman would resist the initial threats of violence and accuse a racist mob of disgracing America.

Gordon devotes chapters to the history of mining and the history of Anglo women in Arizona. But there is no material on the history of the church in the West, or on orphan train placements elsewhere. Perhaps a comparative discussion of placements in the East could have served as a way of checking the representativeness of the sisters’ response to the Mexican families.

To evaluate Catholics of this period strictly by present-day standards of racial correctness is to hinder rather than advance historical understanding and accuracy. The Catholic Church was neither at the forefront of the movement for racial justice, nor at the forefront of Anglo racial triumphalism. For most of the 19th century, and well into the 20th, the ethnic diversity of Catholicism in the United States prevented the church from falling into binary thinking on race.

Catholic history has the most to contribute to American history by exploring the overlapping identities of religion, region, ethnicity — and race — within the context of a church marked by a cultural diversity unmatched by any other single institution in American history. It has the most to lose, however, by allowing the binary oppositions of “contemporary, antiracist
consciousness” to provide the teleology for this history. The Arizona Orphan Abduction suggests the wealth of stories awaiting treatment by a new generation of American Catholic historians. It also bears out Kathryn Sklar’s cautionary remarks on the great distance that remains to be traveled in the integration of Catholic history into mainstream American history.

— Christopher Shannon

Other recent publications of interest include:

R. Scott Appleby, The Ambivalence of the Sacred: Religion, Violence, and Reconciliation (Rowman & Littlefield, 2000). This book analyzes the roles religions and religious actors played in fostering, preventing and resolving deadly conflict in the closing decades of the 20th century. Drawing upon case studies of conflicts in Northern Ireland, Lebanon, Egypt, Israel/Palestine, India, Pakistan, Guatemala and the United States, Appleby develops a framework for analyzing “religious militancy” that helps to account for the fact that each major religious tradition, be it Christianity, Islam, Judaism, Hinduism or Buddhism, produces both religiously inspired extremists committed to violence, and equally fervent militants committed to nonviolent social and political change. The concluding chapters demonstrate how a nuanced understanding of religious militancy can be integrated into our thinking about tribal, regional and international conflict.

Steven M. Avella, Like an Evangelical Trumpet: A History of the Mother of God Province of the Society of the Catholic Apostolate (Palottine Fathers and Brothers, Inc., 1999), explores the history of the Midwestern Palottines of the Mother of God Province from its beginnings in Wisconsin in 1921 until 1975. Commissioned by the provincial, Father Joseph Heinrichs, shortly before his death in 1996, this history draws from a wide variety of primary sources. Avella examines the remote origins of the establishment of the province, the work of St. Vincent Pallotti (1795-1850), the North Dakota missions, community recruitment and the Schoenstatt controversy.

An epilogue updates the administrative history, and considers the identity crisis and mission of the Pallottines as the community emerged under the leadership of three provincials: Joseph Heinrichs, Lawrence McCall, and Joseph Zimmer. Steven M. Avella and Elizabeth McKeown, eds., Public Voices: Catholics in the American Context (Orbis Books, 1999). A volume in the series, American Catholic Identities: A Documentary History Series, under the general editorship of Christopher J. Kauffman. Designed to chart the growth and dynamics of ethnic diversity in the United States, and the impact of cultural pluralism on the formation of Catholic religious identities, the series presents primary documents tracing these themes from colonial times to the present. Public Voices focuses on Catholic participation in American politics, addressing topics such as the Catholic position on slavery, John Ryan’s arguments for a “living wage,” Daniel Berrigan’s role in the anti-war movement, and the United States Catholic Conference’s statements on abortion.

Sister Wendy Beckett, with silhouettes by Dan Paulos and Sister M. Jean Dorcy, In the Midst of Chaos, Peace (Ignatius Press, 1999). In response to Pope John Paul’s letter to artists to promote the Catholic faith through “artistic evangelization,” Sister Wendy, BBC and PBS art critic, presents meditations on 54 silhouettes by the two foremost Catholic paper-cutting artists. The book offers brief, one-minute artistic and spiritual reflections specifically addressed to people struggling to make time for spirituality in the fast-paced world of modern life.

Peter L. Berger, ed., The Desecularization of the World: Resurgent Religions and World Politics (William B. Eerdmans, 1999). Copublished with the Ethics and Public Policy Center, this volume challenges the belief that the modern world is increasingly secular, showing instead that modernization more often strengthens religion. Seven expert observers examine several regions and religions — Catholic and Protestant Christianity, Judaism, Buddhism, Islam — and explore the resurgence of religion in world affairs.

Teresa Berger, Women’s Ways of Worship: Gender Analysis and Liturgical History (Liturgical Press, 1999), seeks to reconstruct liturgical history from a feminist perspective. Berger analyzes liturgical dynamics in two time periods of crucial importance for any history of women at worship — the first three centuries of Christianity, and the 20th-century liturgical renewal. Two major areas of emphasis are the classical Liturgical Movement of the early 20th century and the Women’s Liturgical Movement of the present day. In analyzing the sweep of liturgical developments from the perspective of women’s lives, Berger addresses issues such as the gendered nature of liturgical space, liturgical taboos affecting women, and the emergence of feminist liturgies.

Pierre Blet, Pius XII and the Second World War: According to the Archives of the Vatican (Paulist, 1999), examines the role of Pope Pius XII and his dealings with German diplomatic and military leaders and with the Jews during World War II. Pius XII was severely criticized for his silence, and for allegedly doing too little to alleviate the plight of Jews. Drawing on the 12 volume series, Actes et Documents du Saint-Siège relatifs à Seconde Guerre mondiale, Blet argues that the record indicates that the pope made significant and consistent efforts to protect Jews.
and others threatened with deportation.

Jeffrey M. Burns, Ellen Skerrett, and Joseph M. White, eds., Keeping Faith: European and Asian Catholic Immigrants (Orbis Books, 2000). Another volume in the series, American Catholic Identities: A Documentary History. The original documents gathered and introduced in this collection trace the experience and practices of European and Asian ethnic groups in the United States, and show how these communities contributed to the evolution of the American Catholic identity. The volume is divided into six sections: Establishing the Immigrant Church; Concerns of the Immigrant Church; Diversifying the Immigrant Church; The Consolidation of the Immigrant Church; Asians and the New Immigration; and New Models and Concerns.

Anne M. Butler, Michael E. Engh, S.J., and Thomas W. Spalding, C.F.X., eds., The Frontiers and Catholic Identities (Orbis Books, 1999). The third volume in the American Catholic Identities series orchestrated by Catholic University historian Christopher J. Kauffman. This volume contains primary sources that document the church’s development in frontier America — the backwoods of the eastern colonies, the fur trapping frontier of the northern Midwest, the mountain region, and the west coast. It covers a variety of issues, such as relations with Native Americans, conflicts with other religious groups, and the experience of Latino Catholics.

Gerald M. Costello, ed., Our Sunday Visitor’s Treasury of Catholic Stories (Our Sunday Visitor, 1999), offers a diverse selection of 126 stories that illuminate Catholic faith in action. Relatively short excerpts from previously published works, the narratives are arranged to illustrate basic teachings of the church, including the four cardinal virtues, the seven gifts of the Holy Spirit, the seven corporal works of mercy, and the seven spiritual works of mercy. This anthology includes accounts of the great saints of the past, as well as works of more recent figures such as Dorothy Day, St. Maximilian Kolbe, and the Maryknoll sisters martyred in El Salvador.

Lawrence S. Cunningham, Thomas Merton and the Monastic Vision (William B. Eerdman’s, 1999). A volume in the Library of Religious Biography series, edited by Mark A. Noll, Nathan O. Hatch and Allen C. Guelzo. Taking up where Merton’s The Seven Storey Mountain ends, this biography explores Merton’s monastic life and his subsequent growth into a modern-day spiritual master. Cunningham explores the relationship between Merton’s prolific writings and continuing influence, and his contemplative life as a Trappist monk.

Augustine J. Curley, New Jersey Catholicism: An Annotated Bibliography (New Jersey Historical Records Commission, 1999). A bibliography of primary and secondary source material on New Jersey Catholicism, broken down by diocese and various topics such as political and social issues, education, ethnic groups, and religious orders.

Copies are available for $15 from: Joseph F. Mahoney, Director; New Jersey Catholic Historical Records Commission; Seton Hall University; South Orange, NJ 07079-2687.

Marie Dennis, Renny Golden and Scott Wright, Oscar Romero: Reflections on His Life and Writings (Orbis, 1999). A biographical account of Oscar Romero (1917-1980), archbishop of San Salvador, champion of the poor and oppressed, who was assassinated on March 24, 1980. Hailed as a 20th-century prophet whose life was both symbol and gift to those who struggle in the search for a spiritual path to the new millennium, Romero frequently observed that we run the risk of becoming insensitive to suffering and death. This account shows how Romero’s spirituality, deeply rooted in the Word of God, found expression in his constant concern for the sanctity of human life, solidarity with the poor and the oppressed, and ongoing efforts to bring about a lasting peace in El Salvador.

Jane Daggett Dillenburger, The Religious Art of Andy Warhol (Cortinuum, 1998). This book explores the spiritual side of the "Pope of Pop." Dillenburger locates Warhol’s spiritual roots in the Slovakian ghetto of his Pittsburgh childhood and his close relationship with his mother, with whom he lived for almost 40 of his 58 years. A life-long church-goer, Warhol kept his Catholicism a secret. Warhol’s personal piety manifested itself in the paintings of the last decade of his life: his Skull paintings, the prints based on Renaissance religious paintings, and the Cross paintings. Dillenburger devotes most of the book to the project that occupied Warhol during the last two years of his life: a series of 20 large paintings based on Leonardo da Vinci’s Last Supper.

Patricia Durchholz, Defining Mission: Comboni Missionaries in North America (University Press of America, 1999), offers a glimpse into the daily life and leadership styles of the members of an Italian religious institute struggling to overcome the obstacles faced in America in the wake of the defeat of Mussolini in the Second World War. Durchholz details the political and religious aspects of the community, and recounts the struggle of Comboni missionaries to adapt to America. Finally, Durchholz examines the Comboni’s pioneering work in ethnic parishes and missions through the 1960s, with particular emphasis on the community’s service to African Americans.

Bruce David Forbes and Jeffrey H. Mahan, eds., Religion and Popular Culture in America (University of California Press, 2000), examines what popular culture reveals about the nature of American religion today. The editors divide the essays in this collection into four general themes: the appearance of explicit religious content or implicit religious themes in popular culture; the ways that popular culture influences traditional religions, especially evangelical Christianity; the development of myths, symbol systems and ritual patterns within popular culture; and the ways in which religion and popular culture might critique each other. The essays draw upon a broad range of sources, including cowboy fiction, televangelism, sports and Madonna’s "Like a Prayer."

Olivia Forster, O.S.B., Ardent Women (Federation of St. Benedict, 104 Chapel Lane, St. Joseph, MN 56374-0220).
provides a comprehensive survey of the 50-year history of the Federation of St. Benedict. The history of this federation, "youngest" of the four federations/congregations of Benedictine women in the United States, documents the final decades in the era of American Benedictine women achieving equal status in the monastic world. The work portrays the courage, faith and determination of the women who joined in a canonical union to better maintain fidelity to the Benedictine charism.

J. Matthew Gallman, Receiving Erin’s Children: Philadelphia, Liverpool, and the Irish Famine Migration, 1845-1855 (University of North Carolina Press, 2000). A work of comparative urban history, this book explores how two cities, Philadelphia and Liverpool, met the challenges raised by the influx of Irish immigrants fleeing the Great Famine. Gallman looks at the ways in which citizens and policymakers in Philadelphia and Liverpool dealt with such issues as poverty, disease, poor sanitation, crime, sectarian conflict and juvenile delinquency. Two cities of comparable population and dimensions, Liverpool and Philadelphia faced similar challenges, but often responded in ways that reflected certain crucial differences in location, material conditions, governmental structures and voluntaristic traditions.

Gerald Gamm, Urban Exodus: Why the Jews Left Boston and the Catholics Stayed (Harvard University Press, 1999), examines the fate of two major ethnoreligious groups with respect to the flight of urban white ethnic to the suburbs in the 20th century. When the busing crisis erupted in Boston in the 1970s, Catholics were in the forefront of resistance; Jews, in contrast, fled the city quickly and quietly. Gamm places neighborhood institutions — churches, synagogues, community centers, schools — at the center of his explanation of these different ethnic trajectories. He challenges the long-held assumption that bankers and real estate agents were responsible for the rapid Jewish exodus and argues that the rooted, territorially defined and hierarchical nature of Catholic parishes forestalled the urban exodus of Catholic families.

Samuel Gregg, Challenging the Modern World: Karol Wojtyla/John Paul II and the Development of Catholic Social Teaching (Lexington Books, 1999), analyzes developments in Catholic social teaching during the pontificate of John Paul II. Gregg compares the social encyclicals of John Paul II with the social teachings of the Second Vatican Council and Paul VI on the topics of industrial relations, capitalism, and the economic development of the Third World. Within this comparative context, Gregg considers the degree to which the development of Catholic social thought was influenced by the writings of Karol Wojtyla before he became pope in 1978.

Andrew M. Greeley, The Catholic Imagination (University of California Press, 2000), portrays contemporary Catholics as inhabitants of an enchanted world of statues, saints, holy water, rosary beads and votive candles. These external signs reflect a deeper and more pervasive sensibility that inclines Catholics to see “the Holy” in all creation. Combining theology and sociological survey data, Greeley analyzes the unique features of the Catholic worldview and culture, and examines how this religious imagination shapes the everyday life of modern Catholics.

Ruth Harris, Lourdes: Body and Spirit in the Secular Age (Viking, 1999), explores the miracles at Lourdes in the context of apparitions and pilgrimage. Harris examines the details surrounding the life of Bernadette Soubirous who, in 1858, received the first of 18 apparitions which became known throughout the world. Written from the perspective of social anthropology and personal pilgrimage, the author investigates the importance of the rituals of pilgrimage, worship and sacralization. Harris examines the pivotal role of women and children as visionaries, devotees, and advocates, and addresses issues of mysticism and nonorthodox faith.

Patrick Hart and Jonathan Montaldo, eds., The Intimate Merton: His Life From His Journals (HarperSanFrancisco,1999), consists of passages culled from the seven volumes of the complete journals previously published, including Run to the Mountain, Entering the Silence, The Search for Solitude, Turning Toward the World, Dancing in the Water of Life, Learning to Love and The Other Side of the Mountain. Merton’s reflections offer a readable account of his confrontations with monastic and church hierarchies, his interaction with various religious traditions of the east and west, and his antiwar and civil-rights activities.

Ronald Hoffman, Princes of Ireland, Planters of Maryland: A Carroll Saga, 1590-1782 (University of North Carolina Press, 2000), provides a multi-generational history of the family that produced the sole Roman Catholic signer of the Declaration of Independence. Hoffman traces the Carroll family history from dispossession in Ireland to prosperity and prominence in America. Despite facing religious antagonisms like those that had destroyed their Irish ancestors, the Carroll family nevertheless built a fortune, supported the American Revolutionary cause, and ultimately remade themselves into one of the first families of the Republic.

Pope John Paul II, Springtime of Evangelization (Ignatius Press, 1999). This volume contains all of Pope John Paul’s talks to U.S. bishops in his “Ad Limina Addresses” in the fall of 1998. In these talks, the pope addresses the major critical issues facing Catholicism in America, and urges American Catholics to embrace the present moment as one of great possibility for evangelization.

Mark Juergensmeyer, Terror in the Mind of God: the Global Rise of Religious Violence (University of California Press, 2000). A comparative study of religious terrorism, this book examines the reasons why people take the lives of innocent victims and terrorize entire populations in the name of their god. Juergensmeyer takes as case studies recent incidents such as the bombing of the World Trade Center, the Tokyo subway nerve gas attack, Hamas suicide bombings and the killing of abortion clinic doctors in the United States.

Grailville, located in Loveland, Ohio, relies almost entirely on primary sources, drawing on the United States Grail Archives, her own memories, letters, reports, memos and interviews with Grail members. She traces the history of the movement through developments in the Grail's persistent emphasis on education, empowerment of women, social justice, overseas service and living faith.

Patricia Kelley, *Fifty Monsoons: Ministry of Change Through Women of India* (Harmony House, 1999), relates, through personal stories, the struggles and triumphs of the Sisters of Charity of Nazareth, Kentucky, during their missionary work in India. Kelley traces the growth of the sisters' ministry from their indigenous community in Mokama, Mumbai (Bombay) to other regions. In their efforts to overcome centuries of social and political oppression in India, the sisters have dedicated themselves to rescuing and educating unwanted girls, empowering women to develop cottage industries, moving unjustly imprisoned natives from jails to medical facilities, and enabling prostitutes to free themselves from bondage.

Joseph C. Linck, C.O., and Raymond Kupke, eds., *Building the Church in America: Studies in Honor of Monsignor Robert F. Trisco* (Catholic University of America Press, 1999). This collection of essays pays tribute to the longtime editor of the *Catholic Historical Review*, who also served as a priest, teacher, and historian at the Catholic University of America. The essays, written by the leading scholars of U.S. Catholic history, cover topics ranging from spirituality and intellectual life to the church's relationship with the U.S. government. Many of the articles address important events and individuals that have escaped scholarly consideration in standard texts on U.S. Catholic history.

Wilfrid McGreal, *At the Fountain of Elijah: The Carmelite Tradition* (Orbis, 1999), traces the history of the Carmelite tradition from its earliest origins to more recent times. McGreal stresses the important contribution of women to the Carmelite tradition, including the work of St. Teresa of Avila, St. Thérèse of Lisieux and Edith Stein.

Gary Macy, ed., *Theology and the New Histories* (Orbis, 1999), consists of 14 essays presented at the 44th annual meeting of the College Theology Society. Contributors explore the relation of faith and history from a variety of perspectives, including new methodologies, new readings of old texts, new sources and new praxis. The essays respond to the challenge of multiple readings of history, including women's history, history written from the perspective of minority groups, new sources of history and deconstructionist history.

Cathleen Medwick, *Teresa of Avila: The Progress of a Soul* (Knopf, 1999). A new biographical study of St. Teresa of Avila (1515-1582), who sought to reform the Discalced Carmelite nuns in the 16th century. Mystic and saint, St. Teresa establishes new communities of nuns who lived scrupulously devout lives and, against all odds, sought and received permission to found two religious houses for men. Canonized in 1622, Teresa was declared the first woman doctor of the church in 1970.

Desmond O'Grady, *Rome Reshaped: Jubilees 1300-2000* (Continuum, 1999). Written by a longtime Vatican observer, this book offers a history of Rome and the papacy through the grid of the 26 Jubilees that have occurred since the practice was initiated 700 years ago. O'Grady shows how during each Jubilee Year the Holy See has asserted its centrality and responded to challenges such as the Islamic threat, the Reformation, the Enlightenment, and the loss of the Papal States. He places the experience of the various pilgrims in the context of the state of Rome and the church at the time of each Jubilee. The final chapter analyzes the announced goals and prospects for Jubilee 2000 and explains how the church hopes to guide the faithful into the third millennium with a new sense of history as a meaningful journey.

Kemberley C. Patton and Benjamin C. Ray, eds., *A Magic Still Dwells: Comparative Religion in the Postmodern Age* (University of California Press, 1999). This collection of essays brings together leading historians of religion from a wide range of backgrounds and vantage points to engage the postmodern critique of religion. Scholars of Judaism, ancient Greek religion, Buddhism and contemporary American religion assess the impact of postmodernism on their work, uphold or reject its various premises and demonstrate new comparative approaches.

Perry J. Roets, *Pillars of Catholic Social Teaching: A Brief Social Catechism* (International Scholars Publications, 1999), provides a comprehensive guideline for Catholic social teaching, covering its basic tenets, history and potential impact on modern society.


Lucetta Scaraffia and Gabriella Zarrin, eds., *Women and Faith: Catholic Religious Life in Italy from Late Antiquity to the Present* (Harvard University Press, 1999), draws on a variety of sources to provide a comprehensive study of Italian Catholic women from the fourth through the 20th century. The essays explore the tension between the masculine character of divinity in the Catholic Church and the gender equality evident in the gospels and early writings.

Katrina Schuth, *Seminaries, Theologates, and the Future of Church Ministry: An Analysis of Trends and Transitions* (Liturgical Press, 1999), considers the future of ministry in the
21st century and focuses on how Roman Catholic seminaries and schools of theology are preparing men and women for service in the church. The study evaluates the programs of spiritual and intellectual formation in these theologates. Scott Appleby’s contextual essay, “Surviving the Shaking of the Foundations,” surveys the state of contemporary Catholicism with regard to its ethnic and cultural diversity, internal conflicts over ecclesiology and pastoral practice, and a dual crisis of faith and authority.

Anne Rowe Seaman, Swaggart: The Unauthorized Biography of an American Evangelist (Continuum, 1999). A biography of Jimmy Swaggart, the popular televangelist of the 1980s who brought down at the height of his fame by a motel sex scandal. Seaman argues that Pentecostalism’s particular unstable combination of religious ecstasy and severe sexual repression inevitably leads to the kind of furtive acting out that brought down Swaggart and other evangelists. Seaman also examines Swaggart in the broader contexts of the rise of the Religious Right and the expanding culture of celebrity that has shaped late 20th-century American life.

William M. Shea and Daniel Van Slyke, eds., Trying Times: Essays on Catholic Higher Education in the 20th Century (Scholars Press, 1999), consists of nine essays which grapple with questions of Catholic identity, Catholic higher education and academic freedom. Changing concepts of Catholic theology and religious studies, Catholic colleges and civil law, Catholic universities and their tradition, the silencing of Teilhard de Chardin, and the impact of the 1960s on Protestant higher education in the United States are among the subjects addressed. Contributors include Patrick Carey, Richard Hughes, Alice Gallin, O.S.U., James Hitchcock, and Michael D. Barbar, S.J., among others.

Donna Steichen, Prodigal Daughters: Catholic Women Come Home to the Church (Ignatius Press, 1999). Recounts the personal stories of 17 women of the Baby Boom generation. Each woman describes how she left the Catholic Church to seek fulfillment in the major cultural movements of postwar America, and returned following disillusion with secular culture. Steichen sees these women as representative of a growing stream of “reverts,” and argues against “dissenting feminist Catholics” who predict that women will abandon the church unless they are admitted to the hierarchy.

Greg Tobin, ed., Saints and Sinners: The American Catholic Experience Through Stories, Memoirs, Essays, and Commentary (Doubleday, 1999), offers an anthology of writings of American Catholics from World War II through the 1990s. Included are essays of social commentary and theological discourse, dramatic fiction, memoirs of ethnic heritage, and clashes of conscience, culture, and ideas. Selections from the writings of Jimmy Breslin, William F. Buckley Jr., James Carroll, Dorothy Day, Mary Gordon, Pete Hamill, Jack Kerouac, Mary McCarthy, Alice McDermott, Thomas Merton, Flannery O’Connor, Helen Prejean, Mario Puzo, Fulton J. Sheen, Garry Wills, and J.F. Powers, among others, suggest a broad landscape to view the diversity of the American Catholic experience.

James Turner, The Liberal Education of Charles Eliot Norton (Johns Hopkins, 1999). The first major biography in years of the intellectual father of the modern humanities as practiced in America. A leading figure in American journalism, letters and education, Norton was editor of the North American Review and a founder of the Nation. He was the leading American Dantist of his day, translating the Vita Nuova and the Divine Comedy in what became standard versions. He initiated art history in the college curriculum, organized the field of classical archaeology in the United States, and formulated what has come to be known in college courses as “Western Civilization.” Despite retaining the cultural anti-Catholicism of his Brahmin class, this post-Protestant secular aesthetic in many ways established the Catholic art of the Italian Renaissance as the standard by which to judge all art.

Mary Jo Weaver, ed., What’s Left: Liberal American Catholics (Indiana University Press, 1999), the follow-up to Being Right: Conservative Catholics in America, consists of 14 essays by noted historians, theologians and sociologists. The definitional question continues to inform and complicate Weaver’s mapping project in ways both rewarding and frustrating. David O’Brien’s essay on “public Catholicism” offers a distinction between “Liberal Catholics” and “Catholics on the Left.” Liberal Catholics are noteworthy for their concern with internal church reform; they challenge what they see as a narrow and flawed ecclesiology that excludes married priests, homosexuals, pro-choice Catholics, liberation and creation-centered theologians. “Catholics on the left” refers to Catholics who challenge the U.S. political and business establishment for consistently violating gospel and humanitarian principles. These two groups can and do overlap.

The volume features polished essays on feminist theology and practice (Rosemary Radford Ruether, Susan Ross); sexual ethics (Weaver, Gene Burns); academic theology (co-authored by Mary Ann Hinsdale and John Boyle); liturgy, ministry, and spirituality (Bernard Cooke, Anne Patrick, Diana Hayes); and race and ethnicity (Gary Riebe-Estrella, Timothy Matovina and John McGreevy).

Joseph Wieczerzak, Bishop Francis Hodur: Biographical Essays (Scranton: Central Diocese, Polish National Catholic Church, 1998), presents a series of biographical essays on Prime Bishop Francis Hodur (1866-1953), the first priest and bishop of the Polish National Catholic Church. Hodur advocated the use of the Polish vernacular in the Mass and parishioner control over churches. Excommunicated on September 29, 1898, because of his defiance of ecclesiastical authority, he was elected bishop of the Polish National Catholic Church in 1904. This biography examines Hodur’s life from a variety of perspectives, including his thoughts on socialism, his relationship with internationally
known philosopher Wincenty Lutosławski (1863–1954), and his role in the 1920 Scranton debates concerning the Polish National Church.

Peter W. Williams, ed., *Perspectives on American Religion and Culture* (Blackwell, 1999), presents 27 essays on various aspects of American religious culture. Included are a number of essays on popular and material culture, race and ethnicity, gender and family, and intellectual and literary culture. Paula Kane provides a comprehensive survey of literature, the visual arts, and mass media in Catholic culture in the 20th century. Mary Jo Weaver examines various aspects of modern American Catholic life, including styles of leadership, devotional life, preaching, spirituality, and schools, and examines pastoral problems in the contemporary church. Leonard Primiano examines postmodern sites of Catholic sacred materiality from the various perspectives of economics and marketing, popular and clerical taste, and the liturgical impact of Vatican II. Other contributors include Stephen Stein, Charles Lippy, Amanda Porterfield and Marie Griffith.

Diane Winston, *Red-Hot and Righteous: The Urban Religion of the Salvation Army* (Harvard University Press, 1999). Examining the interaction of religion with urban life and commercial culture, Diane Winston shows how a militant Protestant mission society established itself in the modern American city. A British evangelical movement, The Salvation Army arrived in New York in 1880 and shocked local citizens with its use of eye-catching advertisements and the sensationalism of its brass bands, female preachers, and overheated services. A little more than a century later, this suspect missionary movement had evolved into the nation’s largest charitable fund raiser — the very exemplar of America’s most cherished values of social service and religious commitment. Winston illustrates how the Army borrowed the forms and idioms of popular entertainments, commercial empiricums, and master marketers to deliver its message, and argues for the central role of the Salvationists in mainstream debates about social services for the urban poor, the changing position of women, and the evolution of a consumer culture.

**Recent journal articles of interest include:**


Margaret Bendroth, "Rum, Romanism, and Evangelism: Protestants and Catholics in Late-Nineteenth-Century Boston," *Church History* 68, no. 3 (September 1999): 627-47.


C. Walker Gollar, “Early Protestant-Catholic Relations in Southern Indiana and the 1842 Case of Roman Weinzaepfel,” Indiana Magazine of History 95, no. 3 (September 1999): 232-54.


Andrzej Kapiszewski, “The Federation of Polish Jews in America in Polish-Jewish Relations During the Interwar Years (1924-1939),” Polish American Studies 56, no. 2 (Fall 1999): 45-68.


American Catholic Studies
Newsletter

☐ Two years — $12  ☐ Three years — $15
☐ Working Papers — $5 each (check titles below)

Total amount enclosed: $__________ ☐ new ☐ renewal

Please make check payable to the Cushwa Center. Mail to Cushwa Center for the Study of American Catholicism, University of Notre Dame, 1135 Flanner Hall, Notre Dame, Indiana 46556-5611.

Name ____________________________________________

Address __________________________________________

City ____________________________________________ State ________ Zip__________

Working Paper Series

☐ Roberto R. Treviño, “Faith and Justice: The Catholic Church and the Chicano Movement in Houston” — Spring 1995

☐ Christopher Vecsey, “Pueblo Indian Catholicism: The Isleta Case” — Fall 1996

☐ Kathleen M. Joyce, “Medicine, Markets and Morals: The Catholic Church and Therapeutic Abortion in Early 20th-Century America” — Fall 1997


☐ Michael Novak, “Apologia Pro Vita Sua: The Debate About Incarnational Humanism” — Fall 1998

☐ Mary Lethert Wingerd, “Revisiting ‘Great Man’ History: How the Irish Captured the City of St. Paul” — Fall 1998

☐ Michele Dillon, “The Possibilities for a Pluralisticatholicism” — Fall 1999

News Items for Newsletter
(Current position, research interests, etc.):

________________________________________________________________________

________________________________________________________________________

________________________________________________________________________

________________________________________________________________________

________________________________________________________________________

________________________________________________________________________
THE CUSHWA CENTER FOR THE STUDY OF AMERICAN CATHOLICISM

The Cushwa Center seeks to promote and encourage the scholarly study of the American Catholic tradition through instruction, research, publication and the collection of historical materials. Named for its benefactors, Charles and Margaret Hall Cushwa of Youngstown, Ohio, the center strives to deepen Catholics' understanding of the historical role and contemporary expressions of their religious tradition in the United States. The American Catholic Studies Newsletter is prepared by the staff of the Cushwa Center and published twice yearly. ISSN 1081-4019

Director: R. Scott Appleby
Assistant to the Director: Barbara Lockwood
Research Associate: Christopher Shannon
Publications Editor: Charlotte Ames

E-mail address: cushwa.1@nd.edu
URL: www.nd.edu/~cushwa

Cushwa Center for the Study of American Catholicism
University of Notre Dame
1135 Flanner Hall
Notre Dame, Indiana 46556-5611